Implications for Cote D'Ivoire in the implementation of "new public management" principles, with special reference to the maritime administration

Mariko Mamadou

World Maritime University

Follow this and additional works at: https://commons.wmu.se/all_dissertations

Recommended Citation

Mamadou, Mariko, "Implications for Cote D'Ivoire in the implementation of "new public management" principles, with special reference to the maritime administration" (2000). World Maritime University Dissertations. 52.

https://commons.wmu.se/all_dissertations/52

This Dissertation is brought to you courtesy of Maritime Commons. Open Access items may be downloaded for non-commercial, fair use academic purposes. No items may be hosted on another server or web site without express written permission from the World Maritime University. For more information, please contact library@wmu.se.
IMPLICATIONS FOR COTE D’IVOIRE
OF THE IMPLEMENTATION
OF “NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT” CONCEPT,
WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE MARITIME
ADMINISTRATION

By

MAMADOU MARIKO
Côte d’Ivoire

A dissertation submitted to the World Maritime University in partial
fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

In

MARITIME ADMINISTRATION AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

2000

© Copyright Mamadou Mariko, 2000
DECLARATION

I certify that all the material in this dissertation that is not my own work has been identified, and that no material is included for which a degree has previously been conferred on me.

The contents of this dissertation reflect my own personal views, and are not necessarily endorsed by the University.

Supervised by:

Name: ……………………………..
Office: ……………………………..
World Maritime University

Assessor:

Name: ……………………………..
Office: ……………………………..
Institution/organization: ……………………………..

Co-assessor:

Name: ……………………………..
Office: ……………………………..
Institution/organization: ……………………………..
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank my supervisor, Professor D. HODGSON, whose lectures, handouts, guidance and personal experience in management issues made this paper possible. I am particularly grateful to him for his patience and the accuracy of his advice.

I would like to extend my sincere gratitude to my sponsor, the International Transport Federation, and the University staff, the distinguished officials of organisations that I have visited in Europe and Canada, and all those who contributed to the achievement of my training.

Thanks to all.

Mariko MAMADOU
DEDICATION

This paper is dedicated to my entire family and particularly to my wife Mrs S. CISSOKO who never failed to provide the support expected.
ABSTRACT

Title of the Dissertation:

Implications for Côte d’Ivoire of the Implementation of the New Public Management, with Special Reference to the Maritime Administration.

Degree: MSc

The quest for better way for providing public services has become a permanent process throughout the world. In this perspective, the concept of New Public Management initiated in OECD countries during the early 1980’s appears as an alternative for improving efficiency of public administrations.

This paper intends to highlight weaknesses of public administration in Côte d’Ivoire through identification of shortcomings, and to outline proposed set of actions involved by the implementation of New Public Management principles that can help at strengthening it responsiveness.

As a part of the public sector and therefore concerned with the process, the maritime administration is subject to a special reference, and alternatives for desirable basic structure and action plans are provided.

KEYWORDS: New Public Management, Administration, Bureaucracy, Corruption.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT iii
DEDICATION iv
ABSTRACT v
TABLE OF CONTENT vi
LIST OF TABLES xii
ABBREVIATIONS xiii

CHAPTER 1: Introduction 1

CHAPTER 2: Features of the Public Administration 3

2-1 Basic facts about the State of Côte d’Ivoire 3
2-1-1 Growth tendencies 3
2-1-2 The burden of the long term debt 4
2-1-3 Governance environment 4
2-1-4 The regional co-operation policy 5
2-1-5 Importance of the maritime sector 6
  2-1-5-1 Port activities 6
  2-1-5-2 Offshore drilling activities 8
  2-1-5-3 Environmental issues 9
  2-1-5-4 Human resource development 9
2-2 The government 10
  2-2-1 Principles guiding its composition 10
  2-2-2 The sociological factors 11
CHAPTER 3: Identification of Impediments

3-1 The bureaucratic model
   3-1-1 A systematic division of labour
   3-1-2 Hierarchy
   3-1-3 Strict rules
   3-1-4 Impersonal fulfilment of duties
   3-1-5 Technical qualifications
   3-1-6 Stability and permanence

3-2 Attitude of civil servants
   3-2-1 Concept of exercising authority
   3-2-2 Corruption
      3-2-2-1 Forms of corrupt practices
         3-2-2-1-1 Corruption through public procurement
         3-2-2-1-2 Corruption through taxation regime
         3-2-2-1-3 Corruption of controlling bodies
         3-2-2-1-4 Arrogance of officials
         3-2-2-1-5 Passive corruption of decision-makers
         3-2-2-1-6 Use of public assets for private gain
      3-2-2-2 The consequences of corrupt practices
      3-2-2-3 International mobilisation against corruption

3-3 The lack of accountability and transparency

3-4 The controlling function
   3-4-1 The internal control
   3-4-2 The external control

3-5 First attempts to reform the civil service
   3-5-1 Reducing the number of civil servants
   3-5-2 Privatisation of State-owned companies
   3-5-3 Voluntary leave program
   3-5-4 Performance-based salary
3-6 Development of the maritime administration
  3-6-1 Structural cohesion
  3-6-2 Human resource management

CHAPTER 4: The concept of the New Public Management
4-1 The context
  4-1-1 The background
  4-1-2 The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
4-2 Principles of the New Public Management
  4-2-1 Redefinition of government’s role
  4-2-2 Introduction of effective management in governmental units
  4-2-3 Focus on clients’ satisfaction
    4-2-3-1 Dynamic Administration-Citizen interface
    4-2-3-2 Greater citizens’ involvement
  4-2-4 Use of information technologies
  4-2-5 Quality management
4-3 Is New Public Management a panacea?

CHAPTER 5: The challenge for performance
5-1 Clarifying public finances
  5-1-1 The nature of the fiscal system
  5-1-2 Lack of viable database on taxpayers
  5-1-3 The contribution basis
  5-1-4 The use of the budget
5-2 Downsizing structures
5-3 Development and dissemination of values
  5-3-1 Professional values
  5-3-2 Ethical values
  5-3-3 Democratic values
5-4 Leadership of senior officials and implementation of management rules

5-4-1 A good understanding of the raison d’être

5-4-2 A rational organisational system

5-4-3 The implementation process

5-4-3-1 The payment of incentives

5-4-3-2 Job enrichment

5-4-4 The controlling function

5-5 The use of information technologies

5-6 Clientele management

5-7 Conducting reform of the civil service

5-8 Proposals for a new philosophy of rendering maritime services

5-8-1 Structural arrangements

5-8-2 Staffing the organisation

5-8-3 Updating the legal and regulatory framework

5-8-4 Creating the dynamic of relationship with users

5-8-5 Pro-active behaviour of senior officials

5-8-5-1 Employment of seafarers

5-8-5-2 Development of projects

5-8-6 Implementation of international conventions

5-8-6-1 Hiring qualified Port State Control Officers

5-8-6-2 Training of existing personnel

5-8-6-3 Appointment of a permanent representative at the IMO

5-8-6-4 Certification of seafarers under STCW Convention

5-8-6-5 Prevention of marine pollution under MARPOL

5-8-6-6 Casualty investigation under SOLAS/MARPOL/UNCLOS/ ILO 147

5-8-6-7 Handling dangerous cargoes under IMDG Code

5-8-6-8 Initiating an Incident Command System
CHAPTER 6: Summary and conclusions

BIBLIOGRAPHY

APPENDIX A: Examples of mission statements
APPENDIX B: Annex 4 of the African MOU
APPENDIX C: Articles 1, 8 and 12 of the OECD Convention on Corruption and Bribery
APPENDIX D: List of companies to be privatised
APPENDIX E: List of IMO Conventions ratified by Côte d’Ivoire
APPENDIX F: Confidential report of the State Inspectorate on corrupt practices through procurement in relation with EU financial aid
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1A: Evolution of the traffic of goods in tonnes (trading port) 7
Table 1B: Evolution of the traffic of goods in tonnes (fishing harbour) 7
Table 1C: Distribution of ships according to main flags (Abidjan, 1998) 7
Table 1D: Distribution of ships according to main flags (San-Pedro, 1998) 8
Table 5A: Budget of the PMAD (1998) in F CFA 52
Table 5B: Budget of the Maritime District at san-Pedro (1998) in F CFA 52
## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CMEAOC-TM:</td>
<td>Conference Ministérielle des Etats de l’Afrique de l’Ouest et du Centre sur les Transports Maritimes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMARCO:</td>
<td>Compagnie Maritime de Côte d’Ivoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENA:</td>
<td>Ecole Nationale d’Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F CFA:</td>
<td>Franc de la Communauté Financière Africaine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA:</td>
<td>Japanese International Co-operation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARAD:</td>
<td>Maritime Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLTD:</td>
<td>Maritime and lagoon Transport Directorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NMP:</td>
<td>New Public Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMAD:</td>
<td>Port and Maritime Affairs Directorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCI:</td>
<td>Republic of Côte d’Ivoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SITRAM:</td>
<td>Société Ivoirienne de Transport Maritime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIVOMAR:</td>
<td>Société Ivoirienne d’Opération Maritime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SYSCOA:</td>
<td>Système Comptable Ouest Africain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SYMICOM:</td>
<td>Syndicat des Marins Ivoiriens au Commerce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SYMAPECI:</td>
<td>Syndicat des Marins Pêcheurs de Côte d’Ivoire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SF:</td>
<td>Switzerland Franc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ULCC:</td>
<td>Ultra Large Crude Carrier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEMOA:</td>
<td>Union Économique et Monétaire de l’Ouest Africain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VLCC:</td>
<td>Very Large Crude Carrier</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

When the Republic of Côte d’Ivoire (RCI) was granted national sovereignty in 1960, the public administration was heavily under influence of the circumstances inherited from colonisation. Its organisational system and its practices were based on the bureaucratic model.

During the two decades following the independence of the State, the economy of the country grew sharply. The liberal economic system chosen by the government combined with strong export-oriented agricultural policies produced positive results. All sectors were concerned with this prodigious development which led some economists to address it as the “Ivorian miracle”.

The government engaged itself in a wide program of investment in social and economic infrastructures. Confident in its capacity to reimburse, it borrowed massive sums of money and went on injecting public funds into the economy. This strong state interventionism policy resulted in the creation of a very large public sector that appeared unsatisfactory.

In the early 1970’s, the international prices of the two main export commodities (cocoa and coffee) dropped down to half of their value. The combination of this factor with the effects of over borrowing caused deterioration in the economic situation. The crisis highlighted the need for fundamental change.

With the globalisation of the world economy, and under the pressure of international organisations providing financial aid, the government initiated strategies to improve efficiency of public administration.
The dissertation proposes to outline implications for the country of the implementation of new public management principles taken as an alternative for increasing performance. For this purpose, the different aspects of the public administration are analysed to highlight weaknesses in relation with the structure and practices, and behaviour of civil servants. The literature on the new public management is reviewed and, in the light of the analysis of its principles, proposals are made on the way public authorities can develop alternatives aiming at an increased responsiveness. A particular emphasis is put on the maritime administration.

The dissertation does not take into account the new developments that occurred in the country since the establishment on the 24th of December 1999, of a military regime to run the State. The transition period preceding general elections is expected to end by October 2000 and any reference to decision or action taken in this context would be inappropriate for the purpose of this work.
CHAPTER 2
FEATURES OF THE PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN THE RCI

Guy Peters defined public administration in his book “The future of Governing: four emerging models” as an institution designed to exercise collective control and influence over the society and economy for which it has been given responsibility. The way it is set up and the way officials perform duties evolving out of this responsibility may be subject to different interpretations. However, the World Bank has given in the 1997 World Development Report, some basic governmental tasks that even a weak State should strive to get right. These tasks are a foundation of law, a benign policy environment including macro-economic stability, investing in people and infrastructure, protection of the vulnerable and protection of the environment. This Chapter proposes to analyse the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire through arrangements made by political authorities.

2-1 Basic facts about the State of Côte d’Ivoire

2-1-1 Growth tendencies

Following the crisis of the early 1970’s, a recovery phase began in 1991 when the government accepted a World Bank / International Monetary Fund program of fiscal austerity and market liberalisation including state withdrawal from the production of goods and services.

However, the most important event was the 50% devaluation of the F CFA vis-à-vis the French Franc that improved the competitiveness of Ivorian exports and
led to a strong growth in trade surplus (from USD 734 million in 1993 to 1.86 billion in 1996). The stimulus provided increased foreign aid and investment flows. Meanwhile, the government undertook rigorous macro-economic policies and the privatisation of state owned companies. The GDP growth rate was 7.1 in 1995, 6.8 in 1996 and 7.0 in 1997. Government revenue rose form F CFA 847 billion in 1994 to 1,348 in 1997.

2-1-2 The burden of the long term debt

In 1980, the aggregate amount of the long-term debt of the country reached USD 19.07 billion equivalent to 211% of the GNP. The performance recorded during the recovery phase enabled the country to get back on track with official creditors, both bilateral (Paris Club and London Club) and multilateral (IMF and World Bank), by signing in 1998 a new three-year Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility Program (ESAF). This program opened the door for the country’s eligibility to the debt cancellation initiative called the Highly Indebted Poor Countries Initiative (HIPC). The public sector debt had dropped from USD 16.2 billion to 12.0 billion by the end of 1998. If reforms required by the IMF are fully implemented, the HIPC initiative is expected to provide additional cancellation of debt, and reduce the level to 9.1 billion in 2001.

2-1-3 Governance environment

Since independence in 1960, the same political party, the Democratic Party of Côte d’Ivoire (PDCI), has ruled the country. While the government called for multi-party elections in 1990 and 1995, the National Assembly is still composed of 149 members of that party out of 175. Opposition parties are calling for the institution of an independent electoral body to ensure equitable and transparent elections and to ensure an effective democratic alternative, which is not yet accepted by the government.
However, the political dialogue is much freer than prior to 1990 particularly because of the opposition press that voices its criticism against the regime.

The judiciary system has some major weaknesses. Though the separation of powers is asserted in the constitution, the power of the President of the Republic to appoint officials of the judiciary system virtually subordinates it to the executive. Moreover, experts have found that it is unpredictable and slow.

2-1-4 The regional co-operation policy

Côte d’Ivoire is a member of the West African Economic and Monetary Union (UEMOA) and the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) and is a signatory of the Lome Convention.

The objectives of the UEMOA are to co-ordinate the economic, financial and structural policies of Francophone countries through the following measures:
- adoption of a common accounting system called SYSCOA which introduces a unique book keeping system;
- establishment of a regional Stock Exchange;
- institution of a customs union for the harmonisation of customs regulations and business law practices.

The Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) groups both Francophone and Anglophone states in the region and aims at creating a customs union, which is intended to lead to eventually a full common market and free movement of capital and labour. For its part, the Lome Convention is a trade and aid agreement between the European Union and 46 developing countries in the African, Caribbean and Pacific regions (ACP). Lome arrangements allow duty free entry into EU member countries for a number of commodities produced in the ACP countries.
2-1-5 Importance of the maritime sector

With 550 km of coastline and a lagoon belt around the City of Abidjan, Côte d’Ivoire had a natural predisposition to develop its maritime sector.

2-1-5-1 Port activities

The country has two ports located in Abidjan and San-Pedro in the Southwest. Both are owned entirely by the State.

95% of the foreign trade of the country is moved by sea. As a developing country, with an economy that is based on agricultural production, Côte d’Ivoire needs to export industrial crops and to import equipment for its basic infrastructure. The status conferred to the port of Abidjan after the decision to re-structure the state-owned companies led to it having more management autonomy. The Abidjan Port Authority is seen as a reference with regard to performance.

In 1998, the total traffic of goods reached 15,441,220 tonnes representing a growth of 9.6% compared with 14,089,802 tonnes recorded the previous year (Table 1A and 1B). The main products handled are petroleum, chemicals, food products, general cargoes and building materials. The fishing harbour offers a basic support infrastructure for the operation of tuna ships, shrimp ships, trawlers and refrigerated ships.

About 40 private companies are operating in the port area as forwarding agencies, ship handlers or ship agents. There are also ship repair facilities offering slipways of 350 tons and floating docks with a lifting capacity of 10,000 tons.

Towage services have been privatised and are carried out by 5 tugs having engine powers ranging from 1,500 to 2,720 HP.

The Board of Governors of the port is seeking more competitiveness to increase its involvement in transhipment operations, and the traffic of cargoes in transit to and from land-locked countries.
Table 1A: Evolution of the traffic of goods in tonnes (trading port)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Import</th>
<th>Export</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>7,399,429</td>
<td>4,173,441</td>
<td>11,572,870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>7,895,403</td>
<td>5,465,823</td>
<td>13,361,226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>8,714,289</td>
<td>5,039,679</td>
<td>13,753,968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>9,971,722</td>
<td>5,101,868</td>
<td>15,073,590</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1B: Evolution of the traffic of goods in tonnes (fishing harbour)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Import</th>
<th>Export</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>314,409</td>
<td>80,149</td>
<td>394,558</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>314,261</td>
<td>74,146</td>
<td>388,407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>281,662</td>
<td>54,172</td>
<td>335,834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>325,253</td>
<td>42,377</td>
<td>367,630</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1C: Distribution of ships according to main flags (Abidjan 1998)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NUMBER OF SHIPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PANAMA</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAHAMAS</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CYPRUS</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST-VINCENT AND GRENADINES</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIBERIA</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Abidjan Port Authority – Annual Report (1999)*
Table 1D: Distribution of ships according to main flags (San-Pedro 1998)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FLAGS</th>
<th>NUMBER OF SHIPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BAHAMAS</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIBERIA</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CYPRUS</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DANMARK</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PANAMA</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GERMANY</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GREECE</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANTIGUA</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST-VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITALY</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: San-Pedro Port Authority – Annual Report (1999)

The second port of the country is located in the Southwest. The installation of the basic infrastructure was motivated by the need to stimulate the development in this region. 523 ships called at the port and 1,074,312 tonnes of good were handled in 1998.

2-1-5-2 Off-shore activities

The exploitation of oil reserves within the Exclusive Economic Zone started in 1975 with the discovery of a promising field. The production fluctuated between 500,000 and 1.1 million tonnes a year. The field was closed in 1990 when experts judged it to be no longer profitable. With the development of new techniques of exploration developed by well-known oil companies, the government launched a new program in deep water that led to the discovery of an important field in 1994. In 1995, Ocean Energy, the leading company of the consortium committed to exploit this field, started pumping oil and gas. Later on in 1996, Santa Fe Petroleum, Apache and Seagull (USA), and Ranger Oil (Canada) joined the consortium with production-sharing agreements and contributed to an increase in production to 17,000 barrels a day. Côte d’Ivoire has today enough gas to supply the thermal power plant at
Abidjan-Azito and is almost self-sufficient for oil needs. The geology is still promising and these products are likely to become significant ones in the national economy.

2-1-5-3 Environmental issues

Administrative authorities of Côte d’Ivoire take the threat of oil pollution seriously. The country is located in the Gulf of Guinea that is near the pathway of VLCC and ULCC engaged in oil trade between the Middle East and Europe via the Cape of Good Hope. Moreover, the port of Abidjan has its own installations that accommodate oil tankers of any tonnage for their loading and unloading operations in relation to the national refinery.

The land-based threat to the environment is mainly due to the use of fertiliser in agriculture and the concentration of indigent populations on the coastline. To tackle the problem, the government has made special arrangements that will be analysed in Chapter 2.

2-1-5-4 Human resource development

With the development of the maritime sector, there has been a continuing need to supply qualified personnel either to man the national fleet or to run ancillary shipping businesses.

In the context of regional co-operation with other African states, a Maritime Academy was established in 1975 to train young people interested in a career at sea. 2,150 officers have been trained in this institution since its establishment. Today, there are no longer any sea going vessels under the registry of Côte d’Ivoire since the dissolution of the National Shipping Company. Therefore, it is imperative for the government to seek employment opportunities abroad in order firstly to absorb all unemployed qualified mariners and secondly to maintain the training institution.
2-2 The government

2-2-1 Principles guiding the composition

The first government that emerged from elections in 1960 opted for the single ruling party system despite the political pluralism asserted in the constitution. The former President, Felix HOUPHOUET-BOIGNY, declared that competing political parties would reflect the strong feelings of belonging to ethnic groups and undermine national unity. That was true to a certain extent since the majority of the population was uneducated. In fact, it became clear very early that the President did not accept any form of opposition. Meanwhile, he was progressively concentrating all powers in his hands: the power to appoint ministers, senior officials and managers of State owned companies and the power of policy making.

The President has always advocated the role of people’s education as a major factor of development. In preparing for the replacement of French advisors, he sent successive groups of students to European Universities to acquire the basic knowledge. When this intelligentsia returned home, the President had a difficult equation to solve: to create conditions for their immediate integration in the development process or to create a breeding ground for opposition movements.

He opted for the first solution and went on recruiting them massively in the Central Administration, to a point where there were many more than needed. Some were subsequently appointed as managers of State owned companies, which number was increasing dramatically to meet the above need. These issues played an important role in the configuration of Public Administration and the author proposes to analyse them in detail in subsequent chapters.
2-2-2 The sociological factors

It is generally accepted that setting up a Government with regard to the number of Departments and their functions follows four principles:
1) the functional principle
2) the process principle
3) the clientele principle
4) the area principle

Nevertheless, it is a common practice in developing countries and particularly in Côte d'Ivoire that the President decides first the number of persons to appoint. Then the sharing of governmental functions among ministries follows after. Since the President is not legally required to give any justification for his choice, political observers assume that he is bound by the need to ensure equitable representation of geographical regions and ethnic groups that showed more support during elections.

The size of the Government has always fluctuated following the President’s will. The highest level was reached in 1985 when the President appointed forty ministers while the state was going through a major economic crisis. It is understandable that a Government set up on the above basis cannot obey any clear principle of rational organisation. As a consequence, it happened that functions traditionally devolved to a particular ministry were parcelled out to fit the size of the Government. The example of the Ministry in charge of Maritime Affairs illustrates indubitably this fact and will be analysed in Chapter 3.

2-3 Decentralised structures

2-3-1 Organisation

Executive power is exercised at the regional level by administrative structures called Prefectures. The Prefecture covers a geographic area and is headed by a Prefect who represents each Minister locally. He has power over sub-prefectures within the area and acts as a co-ordinator. The meeting of the Sub-prefecture Council
is held twice a year to review administrative, social and economic problems, to adopt the budget and to formulate development policies. The issues are submitted to the Prefect for approval and then handed over to the Minister of Interior. The Sub-prefecture Council is a forum of discussion where elected officials, heads of public agencies, social groups and individuals known for their active participation in local affairs assist the sub-prefect in performing his duties.

In fact, decentralisation supposes autonomous elected sub-national governments capable of taking binding decisions in at least some policy areas. It is particularly helpful to strengthen national unity when the country is divided along geographic or ethnic lines. This has been experienced in South Africa, Uganda, Sri Lanka, India, and Bosnia and in many other countries. In the context of Côte d’Ivoire, it is more suitable to address the issue within the concept of “Deconcentration”. Deconcentration is the process by which the Central government increases the autonomy of staffs in regional offices without removing the hierarchical link.

2-3-2 Limits of power conferred

Deconcentration aims at bringing the focus of decision-making close to the populations concerned. Based on that, it should reflect an effective interrelationship between those who express a need and those who decide what issues to come up with. Local field staffs know their constituents better than authorities at the national level and so should be well positioned to provide the public services local residents want and need. Physical proximity makes it easier for citizens to hold local officials accountable for their performance. As described above, the decentralisation system in Côte d’Ivoire does not provide enough room to achieve autonomy regarding the development of regions. Since any project coming from a Sub-Prefecture needs to mesh with the national plans before acceptance, it is almost impossible in this context to get the commitment of local populations.
2-4 The Civil Service

2-4-1 The Civil Service Code

The first task of the Government was to provide the public administration with a legal framework. It came up with a law that was adopted by the parliament in 1961. This text, which was inspired by the French model, became the basic document regulating the status of civil servants in their relationship with the State. The concept of “Administrative corps” was introduced, designating bodies of State officials with responsibilities for specific sets of activities. For each body, details about the background required, training, appointment, remuneration and appraisal were determined by decrees.

Ladipo ADAMOLEKUN, a Nigerian writer, in his book “Public Management: A Nigerian and Comparative Case” has made a good analysis of the French Civil Code as adopted by most of the former African colonies. He found that basically, this Code meets the three principles of the management role concerned with human resources:

• personnel utilisation through selection, training and deployment;
• personnel motivation covering remuneration, job design and satisfaction
• personnel protection in relation to working conditions, safety and welfare services.

In the French system, the merit principle is used as the basis for recruitment through open competitive examinations for entering the civil service, and for progression. Adamolekun noted however that there is no personality appraisal during the selection process, since this is seen as subjective and incompatible with the requirement of defining clearly rights and obligations of parties. This is of great importance because as a result, someone may pass the above test successfully and be appointed as an official without having the capacity to develop the fundamental skills of a good manager. Since it happens that officials advise and assist their political
superiors and, most of the time, influence their decisions, more attention should be paid to personality appraisal.

In the light of the provisions of the Code, it appeared also that people with a background not listed in the law but having an expertise needed to function in public administration were to be appointed as temporary civil servants. Moreover, the implementation of the Code was made through decrees, ministerial orders and other administrative decisions. As a consequence, the different positions and their related duties and remuneration were extremely regulated. It could not be otherwise since the civil servant is in a legal relationship with the State. Any change in his status, whatever the extent, needs a modification of the relevant regulation.

Another important characteristic is that the Code provides civil servants with protection while on duty, against both physical aggression and liability. This latter provision referred to as “civil servant anonymity” has been of importance in determining attitudes of workers in the public sector.

In early 1985, the Minister of the Civil Service declared that weaknesses in the Code decried by unions and users would be taken into account in the program of reform initiated by the government.

In fact, when the new law was introduced in 1995, it was not a fundamental shift. However, it brought two major modifications. The first concerned the designation of administrative corps. The new formulation was seen as an open file that integrated existing and new specialisations (computer engineering, chemistry, and environmental sciences…).

The second modification provided a wider scale of remuneration at the top level of the hierarchy; the progression through this scale was based on success in a selective examination and was followed by a short training course at the National Administration Advanced School (Ecole Nationale d’Administration).
2-4-2 Appraisal of the machinery

Citizens see the public administration as a huge machine for which the Government dedicates 33% of the annual national budget. The growth rate of the civil service staff was 8.75% between 1964 and 1986 and the total number of employees was 115,000 in 1986 and 118,000 in 1991. Since the implementation of restrictive measures taken in the context of negotiations with the World Bank, there has been a slight decline followed by relative stability. The wage bill is still important and seems to fluctuate with the annual budget.

Following the bureaucratic model principle, the Code gives power to the superior to appraise performance of immediate subordinates. It is clear that the efficiency of such an organisation will depend on the extent to which the civil servants are individually conscious of the role they have to play. A new era is opening up with the multiplicity of consumers’ associations acting as a reminder. Civil servants are more and more required to perform their duties with regard to the massive resources allocated to them. This matter is analysed in more detail in Chapter 5.

2-5 The role of State-owned companies

As stated earlier, the growth of the economy was mainly based on the processing of agricultural crops. Initiatives taken by some foreign investors, composed principally of French businessmen, were concentrated on the export of goods with little added value.

The government decided to stimulate the economy by creating State-owned companies, gradually covering all sectors: agricultural products processing, light industry, transport and distribution, banking, public works, construction, hotels and tourism.
2-5-1 Reasons for the development of State-owned companies

The Minister of the Economy asserted in 1970, during an interview with the local press, that this policy had three objectives:
1- to substitute for the low level of national private investment;
2- to maintain full sovereignty over sectors considered to be strategic;
3- to develop social programs for vulnerable populations.

2-5-1-1 The State: the main investor

Very few nationals were involved in creating companies due to the lack of savings and the fear of business risks. When analysing the reasons that prevent under-developed countries from making economic progress, the French writer Jean-Marie ALBERTINI asserted in his book “Les Mecanismes du Sous-developpement”, that they are “prisoners” of a vicious circle: They cannot save enough money to invest because they have low incomes. They have low incomes because there is not enough money invested.

Moreover, nationals with the minimum capital needed to start, chose to invest in less risky and smaller sized businesses. Therefore, there were no growth-induced effects for the national economy. People running such businesses were active in local road transport, constructing and hiring apartments unit after unit and management of restaurants. Generally they had also to face the burden of caring for a large family. The combination of the above economic and sociological factors nullified most of the appeal of participating in the national economic growth.

2-5-1-2 Exercising sovereignty

Another goal asserted to justify the State economic intervention in the 1970’s was to ensure independence from foreign interests in the management of strategic sectors. For that purpose, production and distribution of water, electricity and petrol,
sea and air transport were ruled by State-owned companies. In fact, it appears that these businesses needed huge capital and infrastructure that could not be separated from national public equipment. In most cases, companies operating in these sectors were originally integrated in the development plans of economic infrastructures at the national level.

2-5-1-3 The development of social programs

The agricultural sector has played an important role in the development of the national economy. However, farmers have been kept away from growth-induced benefits since they were limited to producing raw materials that were subject to price fluctuations. At the same time, the exodus of rural people towards urban areas, and the important immigration flows, served to increase the pressure on the social needs of the country. To tackle the problem, the government decided to set up companies providing goods and services to these targeted populations. The range of products covered construction, urban transport, credit system, agricultural support services, etc.

By the end of 1980, about one hundred State-owned companies had been created. Following the one-man policy-making rules, the appointment of managers was based on very partisan considerations. Consequently, the bad results of these companies led the Government to dedicate huge sums of money to subsidising their operations.

2-5-2 Inadequacies in the rationale for State-owned companies

Even if the reasons invoked by the Government to justify the State’s interventionism in the production of goods and services are understandable, it was soon very apparent that, in the context of Côte d’Ivoire, the policy was inadequate. In fact the affected companies were suffering mainly from managerial problems.
To illustrate the weaknesses in the management of State-owned companies, the author proposes to analyse the example of the National Shipping Company (SITRAM) created in 1976, but which went bankrupt in spite of all the support and encouragement offered to her by the administrative system.

2-5-2-1 The context

Most African countries have experienced dependence on ship owners of developed countries during the first decade following their accession to national sovereignty. To correct this dependence, there was a need to free their economy from the monopolistic position of European shipping companies practising very high freight rates. On the other hand, it was imperative for them to ensure regular returns for any investment because starting a local shipping business required huge sums of money.

The Liner Shipping Conference System gave to them, at least in the beginning, the opportunity to get more control over the carriage of their foreign trade.

Negotiations for setting up the Code for Liner Shipping Conferences started in 1973 under the auspices of the UNCTAD, but it was only in 1983 that the Code entered into force on the 40/40/20 basis. For its part, Côte d’Ivoire ratified it in 1977.

To ensure profitability of SITRAM the government decided to establish a public agency, the Ivorian Forwarding Council (OIC) in charge of controlling the implementation of the Code in the national shipping market. Furthermore, the Government signed many bilateral agreements with States involved as partners in the foreign trade in order to limit the participation of outsiders to the basic minimum. The fleet of the company was brand new and composed of multipurpose ships designed to be operational in the traffic both from and to Côte d’Ivoire. The company was a member of five Conferences, out of eighteen serving the country:
- the Continent West Africa Conference (COWAC)
- the American West African Freight Conference (AWAFC)
- the Far East West Africa Freight Conference (FEWAC)
- the Mediterranean Europe West Africa Conference (MEWAC)
- the United Kingdom West Africa Line Joint Service (UKWAL).

An important characteristic of the Ivorian economy is that 55% of exports are composed of agricultural products and their commercialisation is totally monitored by the Government. The strong investment policy adopted led the State to be the main importer of equipment. By making all the above arrangements, the Government had created the conditions for SITRAM to play an important role as a sea carrier in the sub-region and to become one of the biggest companies.

The development of the company grew sharply from 1977 to 1985 since its fleet was new and the Board of Directors allowed the borrowing of money from international financial markets under a State guaranty.

The decline noticed during the following years was due to management errors and a combination of external factors.

2-5-2-2 Over staffing

It is generally accepted in the shipping industry that the manning rate for positions should not exceed 1.75. SITRAM had a rate of 3.00, one of the highest in the shipping business. In 1986, the total number of workers reached 1168, among them 810 seafarers. Managers appointed from Abidjan to head local offices of the company in Europe did not have enough knowledge of shipping market conditions, and could not compete efficiently in collecting freight for the company.

2-5-2-3 Management short-sightedness

The management staff did not foresee the closure of the clinker traffic from Togo and Ghana in 1984 that caused the sudden loss of 60,000 tons of freight.
2-5-2-4 Lack of competitiveness

In 1985, computerisation was limited to the treatment of wages and accounting in general. None of the ships were fitted with equipment suitable for dealing with loading plans, bills of lading and container tracking. There was no plan to renew the fleet, which remained the same until the company started to sell them unit after unit.

2-5-2-5 Political interference and attitude of workers

Very often unofficial extra living costs incurred by Government officials on visits to Europe were supported by the company through the budget item “Advertising”. It appeared also that, due to a lack of strong disciplinary rules, crewmembers were not conscientious in their duties. While interviewing a former engineer officer, the author noted that in 1984, the M/V AGBOVILLE lost two hours at the port of Bordeaux because one third of the crew was still shopping. Of course towage, pilotage and other port dues were billed taking into account these extra hours.

Furthermore, crew unions exercised strong powers within the company and their claims led to increased social costs.

2-5-2-6 Inadequate policy

A new Director General was appointed in 1988. He arranged for the company to purchase two second hand RoRo ships, the M/V GRAND-BASSAM and GRAND-BEREBY. The decision was inappropriate since the traffic from and to the West Coast of Africa is mainly composed of general cargo in bulk.
2-5-2-7 Open competition

SITRAM was not well prepared to compete with well-established shipping companies. Relying on the viability of the Code, the management staff had no real strategy to face any change in the market. Meanwhile, more and more countries denounced the Code and outsiders become more and more penetrating. From a level of 5-10% in 1970, they reached 20-50% of the freight carried in 1985.

During the same period, SITRAM had to face complaints from its traditional customers. For example the Banana and Pineapple Exporters Association (OCAB) found that it was cheaper to charter their own ships from the international market. They succeeded in 1993 after a decision on liberalisation was taken by the Government.

The combination of all these factors led SITRAM to record a decline on its turnover.

During negotiations with the World Bank, the Government agreed to liberalise maritime transport in successive steps: bulk and refrigerated cargoes were partially liberalised in October 1994, non-conference general cargo fully in May 1995 and all remaining traffic in December 1996.

In May 1995, the decision was taken to dissolve SITRAM. The case is still pending before the court for the payment of workers’ rights.

2-6 The maritime administration

Even if the concept of maritime administration has a different meaning from one country to another, it is generally accepted that it addresses the executive body that assists the Government in making and implementing policy in relation to the use of the sea, and corollary activities. The importance of this structure regarding both its size and its influence depends partly on the level of maritime activities and partly on the political options of the Government. In Côte d’Ivoire, the maritime
administration has gone through different phases, following development strategies adopted by the President of the Republic.

2-6-1 Historical background

In 1960, the Maritime Administration was a department within the Ministry of Transport and Telecommunications. The Director had under his authority a handful of civil servants whose duty was to keep updated the registry of ships and seafarers. He was assisted by French advisors in the drafting of the Merchant Marine Code and its related implementation decrees. The strong export-oriented policy adopted by the Government led the maritime sector to record a sharp growth. With its economy hampered by heavy freight rates, Côte d’Ivoire joined the discussions on the Liner Shipping Conference System within the UNCTAD in 1973. The President appointed, in 1975, a young Navy officer as Minister of Marine to assist the Government in defining the objectives to be achieved.

The Ministry was staffed so as to meet the requirement of dealing with port activities and related matters, off shore drilling, environmental issues, training and international co-operation.

In 1990, the State was engaged in negotiations with the World Bank. The economy was in the recovery stage after the crisis of the 1980’s. One of the requirements of the World Bank for supplying financial assistance was downsizing the public administration. For its part, and as a result of restrictive measures taken by the newly appointed Prime Minister, the Maritime Administration was concentrated within two departments attached to the Ministry of Transport and Equipment. This basic structural organisation has been kept up to the present time.

2-6-2 Organisation and functions

Basically, the Maritime Administration consists of two departments representing the Central Administration; each of them includes four Divisions:
1) The Port and Maritime Affairs Directorate (PMAD)

The Divisions within this Department are:
- Port and littoral affairs
- Seafarers’ education and administration
- Seafarers’ health
- Maritime safety

The Divisions include Sections in charge of specific tasks. Among them there is Ship Inspection and Maritime Labour Inspection. These Inspections are the technical bodies in charge of implementing the standards regarding safety of navigation and seafarers working conditions.

By far the most important functions devolved to the PMAD are to formulate integrated development plans for the littoral, to ensure safety of navigation by implementing relevant regulations and to ensure efficient management of the human resources needed by the shipping industry. For that purpose, port development, pollution issues, and training and employment of seafarers are the major concerns

2) The Maritime and Lagoon Transport Directorate (MLTD)

It includes four Divisions:
- Co-operation
- Maritime Transport Auxiliaries
- Merchant Fleet
- Lagoon Transport and Leisure Navigation

The Maritime and Lagoon Transport Directorate (MLTD) formulates shipping policy and proposes options to the government for strategic planning. These actions aim to ensure:
- the regular availability of carrying capacity;
- multimodal transport facilities, especially for the benefit of landlocked neighbouring countries;
- the economic role of the shipping industry in connection with the whole economy.

The MLTD is also in charge of drafting all legal instruments related to the practices of the shipping business. It proposes to the Government options for strategic actions in order to ensure protection of national interests at sea and to develop relationships with the international maritime community.

The two Directors are members of the ministerial cabinet and have direct access to the Minister. The personnel are composed of graduates from the Maritime Affairs Advanced School at Bordeaux in France. At the intermediate and lowest levels, people in charge of the day-to-day duties have been trained to acquire the basic knowledge for administrative tasks.

From the above, it is apparent that there is a lack of personnel with sea going experience to assess technical problems. This is a major concern for the departments since sea going captains don’t show any enthusiasm to join the civil service.

An important characteristic of the maritime administration in Côte d’Ivoire is that it no longer has any role to play in the provision of services. Furthermore, some traditional functions are run by different Ministries as a consequence of parcelling out governmental duties. These matters will be analysed in Chapter 3.

2-6-3 Relationship with the maritime service users

For the maritime administration, the population targeted is composed mainly of professionals of the shipping industry, and to a lesser extent, individuals in connection with the use of the sea. This characteristic has led the maritime administration to have a strong technical orientation. The combination of this fact with the effects of the current bureaucratic model in use leaves the impression of a very slow and ponderous administrative program.
2-6-3-1 Relationship with professionals

There are a number of activities concerning people who wish to set up a shipping company, a fishing company, an offshore drilling company, or to establish a local branch of the above organisations, that require a licence. Procedures are usually described in a ministerial order, and require from the requestor the submission of an application including documents that will be checked to ensure conformity with:
- the regulations on the identity and domicile of the promoters and their solvency
- the safety requirements for the equipment to be used
- the extent to which the local manpower will be used
- the payment of fees

The process starts up at the reception desk of the PMAD, and ends up with another ministerial order conferring authorisation to start the business. Between the two, the record may be examined from a political point of view, particularly when it involves a partnership with foreign operators.

2-6-3-2 Relationship with individuals

At that level, the tasks concern:
- seafarers’ registration and the implementation of the disciplinary regime
- the settlement of disputes between users
- the request for temporary use of part of the littoral.

Here too procedures are regulated in detail through orders and decisions, and cases must go through the hierarchy of the organisation.
2-6-4 Overview of the co-operation policy

The co-operation policy of the maritime administration follows the trend of the national objectives set up by the government about this matter. Côte d’Ivoire is member of the Ministerial Conference of West and Central African States on Maritime Transport (CMEAOC-TM) established since 1975. The organisation aims to institutionalise a co-operation basis between member States for safety of navigation and the promotion of foreign trade in the sub-region from Mauritania to Angola.

The 6th session of the organisation held in Abidjan during the 5th and 6th of August 1999 came up with several Resolutions:
- Resolution NO 176/6SE/99 encouraging members to take any relevant initiative to get prepared for the entry into force of the African MOU.
- Resolution No 177/6SE/99 related to the establishment of a Technical Committee in charge of preparing the framework for an effective co-operation between maritime administrations in the sub-region.
- Resolution No 178/6SE/99 on the administrative, financial, technical and pedagogic situation of Maritime Academies established under the auspices of the organisation.

Indubitably the organisation is a powerful tool for promoting safety at sea and environmental issues since it is working in close relationship with the IMO. The major concern remains the financial situation due to delays in the disbursement of contributions. It is imperative for the member States, considering the important role played by specialised structures of the organisation, to keep it active.
CHAPTER 3
IDENTIFICATION OF IMPEDIMENTS

3-1 The bureaucratic model

As in most of the former French colonies, the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire has inherited principles and methods that are based on guidance originally provided to French organisations and that are structured in a very bureaucratic way.

Academics and scholars have found it difficult to provide an adequate definition of “bureaucracy”. However, it is generally accepted that the concept refers to an organisational system with the following basic characteristics.

3-1-1 A systematic division of labour

Official duties are distributed in a fixed manner through a systematic division of labour. Employees are instructed to deal with specific tasks, which represent given steps in the program execution process. They tend to fulfil segmental roles over which they have no personal judgement and control.

3-1-2 Hierarchy

The organisational system is based on principles of hierarchy. The lower level is under the control of the higher. Instructions are received and reports are made through this channel.
3-1-3 Strict rules

All operations are guided by abstract rules. Employees have to follow regulations strictly, either for what they have to do or for the way they have to do it. Their capacity to adapt to changes is consequently limited. Furthermore, they tend to adjust themselves to performing routine tasks since the predictability of the work does not allow any room for initiative.

3-1-4 Impersonal fulfilment of duties

In a bureaucratic environment, an official is not seen as an individual but rather as an actor of the administrative machinery. From this point of view he tends to establish mechanical relationships with clients. Moreover, the official acts under anonymity and cannot therefore feel accountable for the work assigned to him.

3-1-5 Technical qualifications

Officials are recruited trained and appointed based on their technical qualifications. An assessment of these qualifications is made through examinations, and through verification that the official has the necessary diplomas. Some scholars think that it is the breeding ground for elitism. They consider that staffing an organisation should be based on technical competence.

3-1-6 Stability

It has tended to be a characteristic of a bureaucratic environment that an official is provided with a permanent career. The stability of his position confers what Guy Peters called in his book "The Future of Governing" a social contract. An official may tend to oppose any change that threatens his tenure.
Organisations set up on the basis of the bureaucratic model are characterised by a heavy hierarchical structure. The environment within these organisations, by influencing aspects such as procedures, control and strict internal discipline prescribed by rules, undermines initiatives that could enhance productivity.

3-2 Attitudes of civil servants

In any organisation, whether in the public or private sector, human resource management is a critically important parameter in the achievement of the goals assigned. Ladipo Adamolekun asserted in his book “Public Administration in Africa: A Nigerian and Comparative Case” that it is the quality and development of human resources that gives any organisation its competitive edge (p.86).

Quality of personnel and their development are to be seen as the way to ensuring employee’s commitment for achieving goals through an organisational culture, devolved responsibility and empowerment.

In the context of public administration, the success of any management technique regarding the efficiency of personnel depends on the individual ability of each employee to cope with what he is expected to do.

3-2-1 Concept of exercising authority

It is well known that the French bureaucratic model is highly regulated and based on hierarchy. At each level, the civil servant is subject to the supervision and control of his immediate superior. The superior is empowered to give directives, to control their implementation, to assess the subordinate’s capacity to fulfil his duties, and to apply sanctions or give rewards when appropriate. He is entitled to appraise the performance of the subordinate by giving an annual mark taken from a given scale. This arrangement should normally ensure speed and precision through strict subordination. In fact, the sociological factors inherent in Ivorian society play an important role in the interrelationship between different actors. The marking system
was previously solely at the discretion of the superior. Since 1990, and following a ministerial decision, the subordinate has been allowed to consult his marking sheet and to express any objection. According to a study carried out by the Ministry of Civil Service, the average mark raised from 2.3 to 4.1 out of a scale from 1 to 5.

It appears that most of officials involved in marking would prefer to undertake it anonymously. This situation demonstrates the lack of communication and consultation that would normally help at enhancing team spirit between the two parties.

**3-2-2 Corruption**

Corruption is defined as dishonesty or illegal behaviour by people in positions of authority or power. Corrupt practices, consisting of the use of power conferred by legal status, or resources for which management responsibility is given, are pernicious phenomena since they are related to the ethical dimension of human behaviour.

3-2-2-1 Forms of corrupt practices

3-2-2-1-1 Corruption through public procurement

The most widespread corrupt practice within the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire is the over-invoicing of public procurement. The problem has reached serious proportions mainly because it occurs at the level of Departments. The budget allocated yearly to each of them is an aggregate amount of money at the disposal of the Director for purchasing equipment, goods, services and materials needed for running the organisation for which he is responsible. The Director can enter unilaterally into a contract with a supplier for the provision of a required good or service. A certificate of effective fulfilment is issued to the latter who can then be paid at the Treasury up to the amount indicated on invoices. An invoice may be false,
that is to say not justified by any provision of goods and services at all, or it may over value the goods and services. An agreed percentage of the sum taken from the Treasury is then paid back to the Director usually in cash.

This form of corruption concerns also bribery in the allocation of procurement contracts. In this case, one competing supplier, who generally has neither the best goods nor the lowest prices, initiates of the corrupt act.

The lack of sufficient qualified personnel to ensure an efficient control, and the great number of procurement contracts let by the 135 Departments within the Central administration has led to this corruption being developed to a very large scale.

Expenditures associated with purchasing consumable goods and repair services are very difficult to track by State Inspectors. They are not in position to determine the performance of an engine, or the extent of damage to materials. Hiring an expert for these tasks would be a long and expensive process.

By far, the most spectacular case of corrupt practice in public procurement is the so-called “Scandal of 18 billion F CFA (US$ 30 million)”. The European Commission allocated this amount to the country to support a structural adjustment program in public health and administrative decentralisation in 1992.

While being interviewed by Radio France International, Mr ARRION Michel, the Director for Development at the European Commission asserted that his team had been alerted by the absence of any improvement in the sectors concerned six years after the beginning of the program. The audit conducted later revealed inappropriate invoicing practices, false invoices and illegal transfer of money to private bank accounts. For example, as it appears on the document attached in Appendix F, a dressing kit valued 200 F CFA (US$ 0.30) has been billed 3,000 F CFA (US$ 5.0). The Government of Côte d’Ivoire was officially required to reimburse the sum. This has finally been achieved by March 2000.
3-2-2-1-2 Corruption through the taxation regime

Another breeding ground for corrupt practices stems from the taxation regime’s exoneration policy. To ensure the promotion of companies operating in some strategic sectors, the Government had taken the decision to exonerate them from the payment of import/export levies and to reduce taxes on their net benefits. In return for money, the corrupt civil servant would grant the benefit of this measure to a company that did not meet the relevant requirements. The analysis of public finances by the World Bank subsequently pointed out weaknesses related to the low level of tax incomes. It is indubitable that the above practice contributed to the serious situation at the Treasury.

3-2-2-1-3 Corruption of controlling bodies

The practice consists of turning a blind eye toward the breach of regulations. Instead of requiring corrective measures from the wrongdoer or applying fines that should normally go to the Treasury, the corrupt civil servant will ignore the breach in return for money. Two aspects need to be considered as a result of such an attitude:

- the danger that the population is exposed to when they are consumers of the good or service concerned;
- the weakening of the regulatory regime leading eventually to anarchy.

The maritime administration is seriously concerned with this practice. However, no statistic or official record is available because when such corruption does occur, the ship owner believes strongly that he has made a good deal and does not complain about it, and there is no controlling mechanism for people in charge of verifying the safety regulation procedures.
3-2-2-1-4 Arrogance of Officials

It happens that a State inspector may be arrogant while conducting port state control. In fact, in this case, the abuse of the power conferred to him would not be for money. He would deliberately impose administrative harassment on the crew by requiring special working conditions, using rough language, being rude and showing over confidence in his knowledge about legal instruments to be implemented. It is clear that the crew of any ship calling at a port expects to get enough resting time and to be treated with regard to their psychological state after an expedition at sea.

3-2-2-1-5 Passive corruption of decision-makers

This form of corruption occurs at all levels of the hierarchy during procedures for analysing a request submitted by a user of the public service. Though it is highly regulated, the public administration does not provide any regulatory constraint for the civil servant to be bound by a time frame within which he has to fulfil his duties. To accelerate the process, the customer may offer money to the corrupt civil servant who controls the decision-making process. It is therefore appealing for the corrupt civil servant to delay his decision deliberately in order to create conditions for corruption. The lack of transparency that is dealt with in subsequent chapters contributes to increase the cases of passive corruption.

3-2-2-1-6 Use of public assets for private gain

It is common that civil servants in the highest positions use services such as the telephone, vehicle, water and electricity supplied in their office to serve their private interests. This category of officials will often use their status to circumvent customs, where goods would normally be subject to import taxes, or to exonerate
themselves from the payment of fees when consuming goods or services produced by a public body. In these two cases the victim is the entire society through the taxes people pay for the existence of the state.

3-2-2-1-7 The consequences of corrupt practices

When resources allocated for purchasing the goods and services needed to run an organisation are diverted to serve private interests, efficiency is clearly reduced. It is common to hear employees invoking the lack of equipment to justify immobility within the public administration, even though budget lines have been provided with adequate funds. At the level of the maritime administration, the implementation of safety measures involves unilateral decisions by maritime technical staff. Corruption by controlling bodies is difficult to tackle, since for a ship owner who is given that alternative, it is cheaper to pay money to a corrupt agent than make the necessary expenditures to achieve full compliance.

From the above, it is clearly imperative for the maritime administration to promote ethical values and to disseminate them, with the objective of creating more awareness of the consequences of these practices on safety.

3-2-2-2 International mobilisation for combating corruption

Transparency International is a non-governmental organisation dedicated to increasing government accountability and curbing international and national corruption. In its 1999 report on the level of corruption world wide called “Corruption Perceptions Index”, the organisation ranked Côte d’Ivoire at the 75th position out of 99 countries. Côte d’Ivoire was granted the Index 2.6 in a scale from 10.0 (highly clean country) to 0.0 (highly corrupt country).

The legal instruments to combat corruption in the public administration exist but there is no political will to implement them fully. However, the future is hopeful. The OECD countries, which are the greatest providers of aid, are increasing the
pressure to ensure fairness in administrative practices, and responsibility in the use of resources transferred. For instance, they adopted on the 21st of November 1997, a *Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Transactions* that entered into force on 15th of February 1999. The Convention may help particularly to clear allocation of procurement contracts from illegal practices. Another positive step taken in the battle against misuse of funds coming from public loans or donations is the decision of the Japanese International Co-operation Agency (JICA) not to put cash money at the disposal of the government that is being aided. The new system adopted consists of monitoring the investment operations directly from Tokyo. For this purpose, the JICA usually appoints a private Japanese company that then opens a branch-office in the country concerned, and all the expenses are made through this structure.

3-3 The lack of accountability and transparency

In management, accountability and transparency are usually viewed as the tools needed to confirm standards for performance evaluation at the level of individuals and units within the organisation. Accountability is someone’s answerability for his actions and decisions.

According to the writer D. Olowu in the book "Public Administration in Africa", accountability supposes a clear definition of responsibility of the person concerned, the existence of a reporting mechanism, and a system of review, rewards and sanctions. Accountability cannot be enforced without transparency, that is to say the independent access to information about the way the organisation is run.

A manager who is responsible for performing a particular task should be bound to report the result to the person with authority to review that task. He should be given rewards or sanctions depending on the level of performance. In the absence of such a mechanism, the efficiency of the public administration is hampered at three levels:

- actions and decisions cannot reflect the preferences of consumers;
- quality control cannot be implemented;
- officials do not account for the use of the public resources assigned to them.

The situation described above has led officials to limit their actions and decisions to what is stipulated in the rules and procedures within the organisation. Worse, it encourages impersonal treatment of responsibility, and results in mechanical relationships with users. It appears also that the misuse of public funds is always associated with corrupt practices.

3-4 The controlling function

The control exercised over officials within the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire has two main forms: internal and external control.

3-4-1 Internal control

Following the principles of the bureaucratic model, each civil servant supervises and controls his subordinates in the hierarchy of the organisation. At the top level the Ministerial Cabinet exercises control. However, the standing situation within the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire is such that senior officials appointed as the Heads of Directorates carry out both policy-making and implementation duties. Consequently, the control exercised by a structure that is external to both processes is rendered inefficient, since the Cabinet members have no direct influence or control over programs and activities. Officials have, de facto, too much power concentrated in their hands and any error in the long term policy may have serious consequences.

3-4-2 External control

This concerns mainly financial control. Operations are carried out by the State Inspectorate and cover the use of resources allocated, the accuracy of invoices,
and quality and quantity of goods purchased. However, there are not enough State inspectors to meet the requirements for efficient control. Moreover, the staff needs to be familiar with the technical aspects of the goods and services purchased by each Directorate to make an accurate judgement as to the suitability of any operation.

3-5 First attempts to reform the civil service

In the context of the structural adjustment programs supported by the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank in 1985, the government was requested to reduce both the size and costs of the civil service and to improve its efficiency. For this purpose, the following measures were then taken.

3-5-1 Reducing the number of civil servants

The decision was taken to freeze recruitment in 1985. Concretely there was no replacement of staff leaving the service due to death, retirement or dismissal. Moreover, the decision was taken to reduce the number of foreign advisors and to dismiss daily-paid workers whose number reached 16,000.

In spite of these measures, the number of civil servants continued to rise from 115,000 in 1986 to 118,000 in 1991. This may be attributed to the fact that there was an exemption statement in the decision, and the Administrative Reform Commission set up for this purpose had to examine requests on a case by case basis. Finally, the exemption became the rule because the arguments developed by each Department on its human resource management was judged convincing enough to justify flexibility. This led ultimately to the failure of the program.

3-5-2 Privatisation of state owned companies

Another aspect of the reform utilised by the government was privatisation of state owned companies and the sale of state owned shares through the stock
exchange. Economic austerity was a precondition for assistance granted by international creditors, and to meet these conditions, the government had to withdraw from the production of goods and services. About 100 companies had been privatised by 1989, and for those remaining, measures were taken that would make them operate more efficiently through more management autonomy, increased accountability and reduced governmental supervision. In certain instances, this operation has been a success, particularly for the Abidjan Port Authority. However, the process has slowed down because of difficult negotiations with private operators. Additionally, some companies on the privatisation list were in very bad condition and the burden of social measures for dismissed workers was judged to be too heavy. That is why there are still some 20 companies for which the government is looking for partners. Some, like the national air company (Air Ivoire) have been kept operating by the injection of subsidies. In some other cases (National Shipping Company SITRAM) any action proved to be useless and the structure finally went bankrupt in 1995.

3-5-3 Voluntary leave program

Reform measures taken by the government on the initiative of the newly appointed Prime Minister in 1991 concerned the evaluation of each civil servant’s workload. The objective was the re-deployment from over-staffed structures to other sectors in need of workers. The technique used involved first breaking down each function, following which the Reform Commission then assessed the time spent by each civil servant to produce one unit of his output. The decision was taken to encourage identification of any surplus staff, by offering a special allowance paid by the government for starting a private business on their own. The lack of sufficient resources to support this program led the government to abandon it.
3-5-4 Performance-based salary

Unions of civil servants came together and opposed the project of instituting a performance-based salary in the public administration. The decision had been announced in 1998 by the government but, for the first year, it was intended to allocate only enough funds for 20,000 workers out of the 95,000 civil servants. The arguments developed by unions were mainly the following:
- there was no legal basis for that decision since the civil service Code provided a progression in the remuneration scale by seniority;
- the criteria for designation of the beneficiaries were not established;

During preliminary discussions, unions strongly opposed the implementation of this measure that was seen as unfair.

In Switzerland, a similar reform had been initiated. It did work in the Province of Zurich but in Neuchâtel, Lausanne and Geneva, civil servants are still complaining even though the measure started to be effective on the 1st of October 1999. Based on the assessment of the immediate superior, the civil servant is allocated SF 500 for a medium performance, SF 1000 for a good performance and SF 1500 for a very good performance. The assessment consists of an appraisal covering 12 consecutive months, and an annual evaluation interview.

Unions are sceptical about the issue with regard to the capacity of authorities to pay the corresponding amount of money if everybody has a good performance. For their part, authorities are inviting unionists to consider the benefits of evaluation interviews that create more dynamics between superiors and subordinates instead of focusing on the salary dimension.

In its essence, the principle of performance-based remuneration may contribute to increased efficiency in a public organisation. Unfortunately, the political leaders in Côte d’Ivoire failed to get the full commitment of unions before announcing the measure. It was also clear that in the absence of any pre-determined criteria for granting the benefits under the process, there was an important risk of abuse. All these reasons led the government to suspend its application.
3-6 Development of the maritime administration

3-6-1 Structural cohesion

As is the situation in most countries, maritime administration is part of the Ministry of Transport, and is large enough to cover the basic functions related to the use of the sea and the exploitation of its resources. In Côte d’Ivoire, these functions have been parcelled out among a number of different Departments. The reason is the multiplicity of Departments within the Government that leads to the transfer of some functions even when inappropriate. This is also typical of situations where democratic practices are not observed, and poses problems of co-ordination, conflict of interest, and extra costs, as well as acting to the detriment of the customers. The following example, related to fisheries, illustrates the complexity of the problem. When a new fishing company is being set up, maritime officials will check the vessels with reference to safety regulations. For its part, the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries will analyse the fishing gear and assess their effect on the marine ecosystem. Then, the prospective investor needs to apply to the Ministry of Scientific Research through the Oceanographic Research Centre, for the issue of a fishing licence, which will depend on the result of fish stock surveys undertaken yearly. These long procedures may discourage potential operators.

On the other hand, this arrangement may reflect certain positive aspects in some specific cases through the efficient use of existing equipment and competent personnel. For example, the Navy is in charge of Search And Rescue co-ordination and oil spill response because the naval equipment and qualified personnel are already available in this structure.

However, the author suggests that, in order to allow an integrated development of specific aspects of society, ministerial functions must be distributed with regard to spheres of competence.
3-6-2 Human resource management

Maritime transport is being diversified in response to technological evolution in this sector. Consequently, the maritime administration should be prepared to implement regulations regarding modern trends in safety and environmental protection. For this purpose, there is a need to hire qualified personnel who are thoroughly conversant with emerging developments in navigation. As it is, officials in charge of fulfilling these duties have an administrative background and cannot deal with technical matters. It is urgent that the necessary steps be taken in order to render it possible to recruit master mariners, and to create an attractive working environment for them.

In order to raise the level of efficiency in the public administration, it is important that political leaders, senior officials and civil servants at all levels and positions contribute to the identification of weaknesses in the machinery and take the necessary steps to adopt new strategies to enhance productivity.
CHAPTER 4
THE CONCEPT OF THE NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT

The recession that followed the growth in the 1970’s led academics and scholars to develop strategies on reforming the public sector in order to stimulate a new economic take off. In the member countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), they came up with the New Public Management (NPM) principles that aim at bringing back citizens’ trust in their public institutions.

4-1 The context

4-1-1 The background

The 1980’s were characterised by the globalisation of the world economy. Everywhere central governments were losing control of their policies in favour of international organisations upward, decentralised structures downward and multinational corporations laterally. Furthermore, the trend was to alliances between countries, either at the level of the private sector or the public sector. It became imperative for any State even those with a relatively high performing economy, to seek competitiveness in order to adapt to the new environment and to cope with the others.
4-1-2 The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

The OECD is made up of 29 member countries. Its objectives are to create a forum to discuss, develop and perfect economic and social policy. Member countries representing an economic power constituting 65% of world goods and services seek answers to common problems and work to co-ordinate domestic and international issues. The core of original members has expanded from Europe and North America to include Japan, Australia, New-Zealand, Finland, Mexico, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland and Korea.

The Paris-based Secretariat of the organisation collects data, monitors trends, analyses and forecasts economic development, research, social changes and evolving patterns in trade, technology, environment, taxation and a wide range of activities considered to be major concerns of political leaders.

4-2 Principles of the New Public Management

When analysing the principles of the new public management (NPM), Mohamed Charih and Lucie Rouillard asserted in the book "New Public Management and Public Administration in Canada" that it is the birth of a new post-bureaucratic paradigm. In practice, the NPM emerged in response to criticism of the inefficiency of the bureaucratic model that led proponents to believe that a more innovative structure could provide better service to the public at lower costs as well as better morale among the ranks of civil servants. In well-established democracies, the main concerns were issues related to the role of government in society, civil servants’ accountability, the suitability of private management practices in government and privatisation of the production of goods and services.
4-2-1 Redefinition of government’s role

It appeared that in periods of strong growth, large public sectors were created to meet the need for monitoring the trends in the economy. Attempts to maintain these structures and programs resulted in a loss of control over public expenditures and the accumulation of a massive public debt.

The State should not be seen as an engine of growth. It is expected to provide an enabling environment for private sector economic activities by implementing appropriate economic policy reforms and providing the necessary regulatory framework. Therefore, NPM aims at reducing the size of the government by transforming public institutions into small and simple organisational units and decentralising through the transfer of power to local governmental structures. Public administration needed to find new ways of producing and delivering services through privatisation, sub-contracting and partnership with different levels of sub-national governments, volunteer organisations and private entities.

4-2-2 Introduction of effective management in governmental units

One important issue regarding NPM is the separation between policy-making and implementation. In public organisations, officials must be given more freedom and flexibility to develop entrepreneurship, creativity and risk taking when executing their programs. The NPM has borrowed the market model and business principles in putting officials in an environment of competition. Consequently, there is a need to suppress any form of State monopoly, to reduce political control over administrative units and to grant them more autonomy. On the other hand, officials must develop enhanced values with regard to probity, honesty and integrity that evolve from their empowerment. Furthermore, they must be held accountable for their performance.
4-2-3 Focus on clients’ satisfaction

Mohamed Charih and Lucie Rouillard stated in page 39 of the above mentioned book that:

*The new public management constitutes an attempt to transform a fundamental dialectical relationship – that between the state and the citizens – into a relationship between a producer of services (the administration) and consumers (the citizens). Satisfaction of the needs of these consumers as identified by participation, consultation and the new marketing techniques is the ultimate goal of the administration.*

Client satisfaction remains the key focal point of reformers of public service delivery. Scholars developing the idea of NPM propose a set of actions that aim at meeting customers’ expectations.

4-2-3-1 Dynamic administration-citizen interface

Provision of public services must be made through organised structures able to perform duties in the most productive way. For that purpose, central governments should create, strengthen, monitor and assist local units, which will be granted the capacity to undertake development activities. These units are expected to identify core activities and eliminate all unnecessary ones. Where it is suitable, activities will be shifted to agencies, private operators or volunteer organisations for which the central government may provide financial support, or ensure technical supervision.

4-2-3-2 Greater citizens’ involvement

Officials need to have a greater knowledge about their clients and to accommodate their interests in the decision-making process, instead of implementing public policy directly through regulations in an authoritative way.
By means of service delivery surveys and an analysis of customers’ complaints and potential customers’ comments, officials are required to determine clients’ expectations, to identify indicators of service delivery performance and to set targets for future performance.

4-2-3-3 Use of information technologies

The public sector must respond to and assimilate evolving technology. The use of information technologies aims at facilitating the delivery of public services and at improving internal processes within organisations, since information is a vital resource. From a simple telephone call to electronic commerce on-line, governmental units must be able to cope with the client. Direct accessibility to shared databases through electronic mail or the Internet can lead to a widespread collaboration between geographically dispersed organisations. It also gives to clients self-service opportunities on government service delivery programs.

4-2-3-4 Quality management

Total Quality Management principles aim at reviewing all activities within the organisation, to ensure that they are optimally directed at satisfying clients’ expectations and to minimise wastes and rework. In this process, quality is built into each set of actions in order to make the output conform to clients’ requirements and to prevent errors.

Total Quality Management implies commitment and involvement of the entire workforce. For this purpose, each employee must be considered as an expert, the only person that can work at identifying and analysing obstacles to improving work processes at the level of his position, and that knows how to do the work right the first time.

It also implies for managers to learn how to achieve more production from a given resource allocation, through elimination of non-conformance costs. It is clear
that costs in relation with customers’ complaints, loss of material or waste of time for long lasting and poorly planned meetings are non-productive and contribute to weaken responsiveness. That is why quality must be seen as a permanent and radical rethink of how every operation should be performed for enhancing productivity and efficiency.

4-3 Is New Public Management a panacea?

Guy Peters asserted in his book "The future of governing: Four Emerging Models" that in public sector reform, each solution tends to create its own set of problems, which in turn will create a new set of reforms. The NPM has been defended by its proponents as an aggregate set of ideas and principles borrowed from many schools of thoughts, that aims at providing services of better quality to public consumers. However, its development has also brought criticism from some scholars.

The implementation of market-based principles in public affairs management has been seen as a monetarist approach. Opponents to the NPM believe that considering the state as a business like any other leads necessarily to a tendency to ignore the importance and the implications of public law that governs public institutions. From this point of view, the applicability of a private sector management approach to government seems to have been overestimated.

The NPM proposes in the distribution of functions between the permanent career official and the temporary political executive a clear separation between policy-making and implementation. It appears however, that the public administration has a role to play in governance and cannot be isolated from political decision-making centres. This issue tends to be more confusing at the level of executive agencies, which are governmental units assigned with policy-making powers while, in their basic structure, they are organised and run like any Department within the public administration.

Permanence and stability of civil servants are under attack by promoters of the NPM. As alternative solutions, they propose contracting and consultancy
arrangements and temporary employment at peak times. On the one hand, these issues are not clearly defined nowadays nor appraised to assess their contribution at reducing public costs. On the other hand, they involve social problems in relation to employment of the civil servants concerned.

Another criticism concerns ethical values like probity and honesty that may be downplayed to the benefit of flexibility and freedom granted to officials. Moreover, the need for transparency in the running of public affairs enters into conflict with confidentiality in business transactions and may be prejudicial to the success of the private-public partnership.

Criticism of NPM also includes the fact that most of services delivered by public administrations are outside the scope of private sector and are not quantifiable. By focusing on their individual clients, new public managers shift their attention away from the larger community seen as the essence of public service.

In developing countries, the issues related to the capacity of NPM to enhance efficiency must be considered with regard to:
- the social costs of dismissing surplus civil servants;
- the costs of the necessary technological equipment, its maintenance and the need for technically competent personnel
- the balance of the budget in relation to the public debt.
CHAPTER 5
THE CHALLENGE OF PERFORMANCE

All around the world, the quest for the perfect way of structuring and managing public organisations has continued for decades. It is clear that consumers of public services are becoming more vocal in demanding better quality, and that there is more and more awareness among political entities of the need to ensure a rational use of public resources. It is therefore imperative for any State to adopt strategies that can help in improving efficiency in the public administration. For a developing country like Côte d’Ivoire, the need is more acute because it is a step to enable international aid programs. In this context, there are some points on which an emphasis must be placed in order to assemble a suitable combination of factors for raising the level of performance.

5-1 Clarifying public finances

In order to exercise collective control and influence over society, any government needs to have at its disposal adequate resources that are sufficient to allow the performance of basic tasks. The income of the public administration is made up principally of taxes received through different activities carried out by citizens, or from charges when the entity is providing services to particular groups of interests.

In the context of Côte d’Ivoire, the main challenges with regard to public finances are the determination of the contribution basis to ensure equitable and regular payment of taxes by operators and citizens, and the efficient use of the budget.
In 1999, the total amount of taxes collected by the Ministry of Finance through all its relevant bodies reached only F CFA 647 billion (US $ 1.047 billion) of which 20 billion (3%) represented land taxes. By 31st of May 2000, only 240.7 billion has been collected. In fact, two major problems need to be solved for improving the level of tax collection.

5-1-1 The nature of the fiscal system

Côte d’Ivoire has adopted a system of tax declaration based on the taxpayer’s own initiative. The public administration checks the accuracy afterward. On this basis, any declaration is presumed sincere and any error is presumed made in good faith. The system encourages tax evasion since an incorrect declaration does not lead to sanctions. The initiative of evaluating the amount to be paid by an operator should be taken by the public administration through a careful analysis of companies’ balance sheets and incomes of individuals.

5-1-2 Lack of a viable database on taxpayers

Because of an inefficient address database, it is difficult to identify taxpayers and ensure that they pay their contributions. As a consequence, the arrears of land taxes, for example, reached F CFA 80 billion in 1999.

The fiscal administration needs to be re-structured to improve its efficiency by creating regional and local tax collection centres that ensure full coverage of the territory. Moreover, the database needs to be established by each city in association with those community authorities that have the best knowledge of people living in their areas.
5-1-3 The contribution basis

The fiscal regime focuses on big companies having a turnover of more than F CFA 1 billion and which in turn act as tax collectors for the government by levying taxes on their customers and employees. It would be more effective to render each operator responsible for the direct payment of his taxes. Furthermore, the basis should be extended to liberal professions and artisans. Taxes on added value should also be extended to more products manufactured within the territory and all unjustified exemptions cancelled. Finally, the fiscal administration should utilise more often the appropriate procedures for arrest, and the judicial sale of assets belonging to people who have evaded payment.

5-1-4 The use of the budget

It is clear that, for a developing country, priority should be given to expenditures that involve strong returns and create a ripple effect for the benefit of the entire society. From this point of view, expenses in relation to running public administrations must be limited to the very necessary level. State Inspectors should be instructed to check the real needs of each administration, and ensure that an efficient use is made of resources that are allocated in order to avoid wastes and corrupt practices.

The analysis of the budget allocated to the Maritime Affairs Directorate for the year 1998 shows that some budget items do not reflect reality. For example, it is hardly understandable why the sum of F CFA 13,083,000 (representing 32,707 litres) has been allocated for purchasing fuel, though the organisation uses only 5 vehicles (Table 5A). Another point that needs to be clarified is why a sum of F CFA 4,820,000 has been allocated for maintenance of superstructure, though the Directorate is located in a public building for which the Ministry of Construction and Urbanism ensures the maintenance. Furthermore, despite its dissolution by a
ministerial order in 1996, the Southwest Maritime District has been allocated a budget of F CFA 8,871,000 (Table 5B).

Table 5A: Budget of the Port and Maritime Affairs Directorate (1998), in F CFA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BUDGET ITEMS</th>
<th>BUDGET REQUESTED</th>
<th>BUDGET ALLOCATED</th>
<th>VARIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Furniture</td>
<td>37,810,000</td>
<td>5,509,000</td>
<td>-32,301,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Light Equipment</td>
<td>33,800,000</td>
<td>6,197,000</td>
<td>-27,603,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td>38,689,000</td>
<td>6,468,000</td>
<td>-32,221,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Equipment</td>
<td>66,220,000</td>
<td>6,197,000</td>
<td>-60,023,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dressing</td>
<td>880,000</td>
<td>551,000</td>
<td>-329,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance (Offices)</td>
<td>76,200,000</td>
<td>4,820,000</td>
<td>-71,380,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance (Vehicles)</td>
<td>42,850,000</td>
<td>4,130,000</td>
<td>-38,720,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel and lubricants</td>
<td>120,070,000</td>
<td>13,083,000</td>
<td>-106,987,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other expenses</td>
<td>40,000,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-40,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>456,519,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>46,955,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>-409,564,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5B: Budget of the Maritime District at San-Pedro (1998) in F CFA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BUDGET ITEMS</th>
<th>BUDGET REQUESTED</th>
<th>BUDGET ALLOCATED</th>
<th>VARIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Furniture</td>
<td>3,740,000</td>
<td>689,000</td>
<td>-3,050,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Light Equipment</td>
<td>15,900,000</td>
<td>1,376,000</td>
<td>-14,524,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td>5,210,000</td>
<td>387,000</td>
<td>-4,823,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Equipment</td>
<td>6,800,000</td>
<td>581,000</td>
<td>-6,219,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dressing</td>
<td>300,000</td>
<td>42,000</td>
<td>-258,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance (Offices)</td>
<td>29,000,000</td>
<td>4,131,000</td>
<td>-24,869,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance (Vehicles)</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
<td>581,000</td>
<td>-419,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel and lubricants</td>
<td>4,500,000</td>
<td>1,084,000</td>
<td>-3,416,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>66,450,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,871,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>-57,579,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The 1998 Budget of the Ministry in charge of Energy and Transports
5.2 Downsizing structures

As described in Chapter 3, the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire remains the country’s largest employer with 95,000 workers identified at the last census held in 1995. The budget allocated for the payment of wages and allowances fluctuates between 346 billion and 408 billion and represents about 30% of the public budget.

It is clear that for a developing country where the State is only expected to provide the basic infrastructure and to ensure its maintenance, such levels of resource allocation are not economically acceptable. Moreover, the current situation creates a breeding ground for inefficiency due to overstaffing and under-use of the working capacity.

The problem is particularly acute in the Abidjan area where there is a strong concentration of civil servants to the detriment of the countryside.

To rectify this situation, the following steps should be considered:
- strengthening the privatisation process of state owned companies;
- strong human resource management;
- evaluation of the workload and reduction in the number of the personnel to the minimum required effectively to run each Department;
- dismissal of unnecessary personnel and adoption of social measures oriented at their re-insertion in the private sector.

According to statistics published in the book of Ladipo Adamolekun cited in reference, these strategies have been successful in New Zealand where the public staff was reduced from 88,000 to 35,000 within 5 years. It is also reported that Uganda reduced its civil service staff from 320,000 in 1992 to 150,000 in 1996, by implementing the following measures:
- effective implementation of retirement regulations;
- forced retirement for employees seen as incompetent, unqualified or recruited under corrupt circumstances;
- elimination of “ghost employees” from the payroll;
- voluntary retirement initiative.
5-3 Development and dissemination of values

The context of the public administration in Côte d'Ivoire is heavily influenced by sociological and cultural factors that do not necessarily conform with standard management principles. Moreover, there is predominance of factors related to individual behaviour that determine the way civil servants respond to responsibility assigned to them. It is imperative that persons who have in their hands public funds and assets for providing services to citizens obey professional, ethical and democratic values.

5-3-1 Professional values

Officials should be bound by a results-based accountability. In each Department, performance in achieving goals must be seen as part of the production process at all levels of the hierarchy. For that purpose, there is a need to establish a formal system of assessment. The current procedure for assessing performance consists of a report of activity that is transmitted each year to the Ministerial Cabinet for evaluation. The system is inefficient for two reasons:
- the report is not preceded by an operational plan that would give the Cabinet a basis for comparison, in order to make an efficient assessment;
- the report is not followed by an interview with the assessor to give a feedback.
Furthermore, associations of consumers should be encouraged to voice their complaints against the public administration and be given the opportunity to seek redress when they are victims of any act or decision of officials.
5-3-2 Ethical values

The development of ethical values aims to create more individual awareness about the mission of the organisation to which the civil servant belongs. Getting the moral commitment of civil servants to increase efficiency and responsiveness is a powerful tool to tackle the development of corruption, the use of public assets for private gain and the differences in treatment of customers according to their origin. These values that are related to honesty, loyalty, respect and equity, can be enforced through different means:

- the regulatory framework by introducing a Code of Conduct as an Annex to the Legal Status of the Civil Service; the code would contain statements on honour, diligence, dedication, consciousness, punctuality, etc...
- the training through special modules at the National Administrative School; at an early stage, it is easier to modulate the personality of workers by teaching principles regarding patriotism, honesty, responsibility and due care.
- the control carried out by an independent body; however, it may be efficient only if effective sanctions underlie it, in the event of misconduct.

To address specifically the problem of corruption, public authorities need to build up safeguards on operations known to be concerned with this practice. These measures may include:

- identification and registration of suppliers;
- requirement of publishing prices of goods and services;
- use of computers for tracking state-owned assets.

5-3-3 Democratic values

Officials need to maintain openness in the way they are running public organisations. Democratic values concern mainly interrelationships between the civil servants and their social environment. Political, philosophical and religious beliefs should not interfere in the relationship between fellow workers in the hierarchy and
between workers and customers. On this basis, officials must accommodate the interests of both the lowest-level employees and clients in their decision-making process. It is noticeable that the media can also play an important role in preserving a democratic environment. Confidentiality invoked most of the time by officials is seldom justified in denying access to information.

5-4 Leadership of senior officials and implementation of management rules.

The success of any public organisation is mainly based on the careful combination of many factors that include for example:
- the aptitude of decision-makers to prepare personnel for commitment to the organisation;
- getting the work done according to pre-established codes of conduct and methods of production
- reaching objectives through an efficient use of the resources allocated, either human, financial or physical.

The prerequisite of such processes remains the awareness of senior officials themselves about how they should be conducted. Since 1995, L’École Nationale d’Administration has initiated, in association with the Institute of Public Administration of Canada, a series of seminars on public management for the benefit of civil servants in position requiring decision making. As a result of having taken part to these seminars in 1997, the author has noted that the average age of participants was above 45 and there was a clear lack of receptivity to the new ideas developed by lecturers. For these reasons, the author proposes that the seminars be, instead, part of the basic training at the ENA provided to prospective administrators.

The strategy of disseminating a minimum knowledge of management at an early stage helps to prevent civil servants from acquiring negative habits and creates a breeding ground for a new generation of managers.

Basically, the challenge of efficiency in the public administration centres on the battle to get rid of the bureaucratic model.
It appears, in the light of the analysis of this model made in Chapter 3, that the type of organisational system it involves is heavily burdened with procedures.

5-4-1 A good understanding of the raison d'être

When a new government is appointed, the first task of each Minister is to issue an order determining the functions that have to be devolved to each Directorate within his Department. The use of terms with broad meaning cannot help staff at all to understand what society is expecting civil servants to do. In the light of that, each Directorate should be directed to develop statements on the mission and the vision of his organisation and ensure that they are approved and well understood at all levels.

Every civil servant coming to work must bear in mind in a very clear way that he is vested with power only by virtue of his status to fulfil the tasks for which he is responsible, with the aim to reach determined objectives in relation to client satisfaction. He or she must be able at the end of the day to review the job done and feel satisfaction of fulfilment.

It is a common practice in developed countries, that the mission statement and the vision of the organisation be printed and posted up, so that personnel can read it every day. Some examples related to European and American administrations are attached in Annex.

Moreover, senior officials should entertain regular discussion with staff on the objectives assigned to the organisation and the strategies that have been planned and adopted in order to achieve them. They should insist particularly on the respect of public property and the efficient use of resources allocated to them.

5-4-2 A rational organisation system

Officials should implement measures described in point 5-2 of this Chapter, that aim at downsizing the structure of their organisation and enhancing the productivity of individuals. Such measures may, for example, include
- ensuring the optimum use of the full working capacity of each agent, by grouping functions of same level when appropriate;
- suppression of unnecessary levels in the management;
- job enrichment at all positions, and appointment of the most suitable agents;
- delegation of authority down to the lowest practicable levels;
- closing the gap between resources requested and resources allocated by adopting strategies that accommodate the reality.

It is important that the basic structure of an organisation, the interrelationship between workers, and the mobilisation of resources, create a dynamic that moves the organisation towards improvements in responsiveness.

5-4-3 The implementation process

Rules and procedures prescribed in bureaucratic administrations encourage officials to refrain from being imaginative. In fact, in this system, workers tend to limit themselves to what regulations require them to do. The trend should be to encourage innovative ideas and initiatives.

The implementation process should be the focal point for public administration managers. A clear separation between policy-making and implementation enables them to be doers instead of thinkers. For that reason, the author suggests the creation of a policy-making body within each ministerial cabinet or in the form of an independent agency in charge of determining the strategic orientation of the department.

To get commitment at all levels of the hierarchy, it is important that officials concern themselves with personnel motivation. This may take different forms. In the context of the public administration in Côte d’Ivoire, the following are more likely to be effective.
5-4-3-1 The payment of incentives

The remuneration system in use does not provide enough room for particular circumstances since the budget voted at the beginning of the year determines the sum to be paid to each worker based on his or her category. However, some departments like the maritime administration have specific incomes comprising, for example, 30% of all taxes levied for the issue of administrative documents. These resources have been institutionalised since 1997, and are being used for the payment of incentives to staff on the basis of the category. The distribution criteria of these bonuses should be based on performance, merit and recognition of individual competence.

5-4-3-2 Job enrichment

In certain positions, workers have to fulfil repetitive and predictable tasks which can become quickly boring. Grouping those tasks to give more responsibility to agents, or assigning them to a team in charge of a wider range of tasks may increase their motivation. A typical example is the reception function at the Maritime Affairs Directorate, where the agent receives records related to users’ requests and submits them to the Director. This latter decides which head of section or division will deal with the matter. When records do not meet requirements, they are returned to reception and handed over to the user at the date he would normally expect to take what he was asking for. It would be more reasonable to allow the agent at the reception to check compliance of records, before a date is given to the user for provision of feedback which should concern only the feasibility of the request, and not its receivability. Giving such responsibility contributes to enriching the job and, at the same time, prevents the user from taking unnecessary steps.
5-4-4 The controlling function

The controlling function within an organisation consists of checking whether the work is done according to what has been planned. It aims at ensuring the best results and at limiting waste by identifying at an early stage where corrective measures are needed. On the other hand, the hierarchical control in use within bureaucratic models may hamper productivity.

Some administrations in OECD countries have dealt with it through the concept of Total Quality Management. When the principles are fully implemented, the control function is seen as an integral part of the working process and not as another step. Each worker is engaged in a continuous checking process of his own work to ensure conformity with defined strategies in order to reach the goals of the organisation.

5-5 The use of information technology

Computerisation has caused a revolution in management techniques and approaches whatever the type and size of organisations. Since information is a vital resource, its collection, storage, interpretation and efficient use for decision-making must be matter of a major concern and interest for any manager. The globalisation of the economy has made it necessary to develop responsiveness based on the speed at which duties may be performed in an efficient way.

In public administration, where the management of resources is usually centralised within one department, the efficient use of computers may help to increase performance. It is hardly understandable that to determine the number of civil servants, the Ministry of Civil Service is still using the technique of census. Such an operation calls for significant personnel, mobilisation of extensive resources and is subject to high rates of errors. Under these circumstances, it is difficult to tackle the problem of phantom workers because the ingoing and outgoing flows of civil servants can never be mastered. It appears also that the recruitment, deployment
and promotion of personnel and the record of their rewards and sanctions suffer delay due to manual treatment. Based on the same principle, another important issue related to computerisation is the management of budget lines and assets belonging to the state. Tracking any resource, either financial or on the form of assets and equipment, can prevent its misuse and discourage corruption.

The key goal for the public administration remains the satisfaction of the customer’s expectations. Consequently, instantaneous access to information when required should be made possible for the users, particularly those located in remote areas. It is becoming increasingly necessary for the public administration to extend beyond the use of computers in closed circuits, and progress to a network system. When several Departments can use the same database, the State is able to save money and equipment.

It is clear that the acquisition of equipment, and the training and development of qualified personnel are very expensive, but the experience of pioneer countries has shown that, over the long term, the cost/benefit ratio is economically positive.

However, to ensure a smooth transition to widespread and effective computerisation, it is imperative that managers take into account the following steps:

- to make a clear definition of opportunities and needs in order to establish priorities;
- to identify potential areas of resistance and issues affecting information system, and deal with them expeditiously;
- to ensure that the economic environment is stable enough to permit long-term planning;
- to ensure the availability of sufficient in-house skills in information systems analysis and technical maintenance;
- to establish preferred types of technology;
- to assess financial implications;
- to develop clear action plan for implementation.
5-6 Clientele management

Since the final objective of any public administration is to provide services to the users, it is important that the expectations of these targeted people be taken into account. In this respect, customers are key players in the public administration system. It is the duty of officials to identify and collect clients’ preferences by means of meetings or formal surveys, and to maintain a close relationship with associations. In addition, the following steps should be taken:
- Establishing quality standards for the provision of service at the level of each Department; a formal assessment is needed to check the implementation of this measure;
- Introducing new techniques aimed at improving the production process; for example, when functions are parcelled out among several Departments, these organisations will need to work at creating "one-stop" services;
- Anticipating the needs of customers by keeping readily available data that may guide or advise them in the activities they plan to carry out.

5-7 Conducting reform of the Civil Service

As developed in Chapter 3, there have been several attempts to reform the Civil Service in Côte d'Ivoire. These reforms did not bring about fundamental change mainly because the target was a reduction in the size and costs of the public administration in line with the recommendations of international fund suppliers. Economic considerations inevitably took precedence and none of these operations addressed efficiency, performance or client satisfaction. In order to raise quality, it is important to put an emphasis on the way organisations are performing their mission.

The first step to be taken in conducting reform is to create an enabling environment. It is vital that, at every level of the hierarchy, all employees are informed about what is going to take place, and are aware of what they are expected to do. At that stage, senior officials have an important role to play since they must
use their leadership skills to inform, prepare and ensure that the lowest levels are as fully committed as possible to the success of the program.

The second step consists of deciding which body will monitor the process. It is not surprising that the Ministry of Civil Service has shown some limits in performing such challenges, since the Department itself is subject to criticism about the way its traditional functions are performed. In this context, it would probably be appropriate to call upon an independent body with the necessary in-house skills, such as the Centre Ivoirien de Recherche Economique et Sociale (Ivorian Economic and Social Research Centre) to perform this function. This structure is a public agency that carries out studies and surveys on different aspects of the Ivorian economy and society. It is run by eminent officials from university circles, with specialised backgrounds covering the full range of administrative sciences.

Once tasked, the structure that has been designated will set up strategies in co-operation with the Ministry of Civil Service, in order to manage properly the reform process, focusing on the following points:
- establishment of the diagnostic to establish weaknesses without any complaisance;
- definition of the objectives: development of leadership, commitment, and motivation;
- definition of the process approach by establishing priorities, timing, sources for funding and training if needed;
- implementation of the process itself;
- assessment and the taking of corrective measures.

**5-8 Proposals for a new philosophy of rendering maritime service**

In Côte d’Ivoire, the maritime administration consists of a small sized central administration that represents the executive body of the Government in the maritime field, together with a number of public institutions that provide services on a commercial basis. The capacity of a public structure to provide efficiently commercialised services depends on its ability to be managed in a commercial way.
It is known that the day-to-day activities of these structures require management of cash flow, quick decision-making processes and autonomy. A well-established example is the Abidjan Port Authority, which provides not only port services but also canal, dredging, pilotage and navaid services 24 hours a day. It is clear that the maintenance of a lighthouse or the purchase of fuel and lubricant for dredging equipment can not suffer any delay due to procedures.

This basic organisational system adopted by the government has led the central administration to focus principally on policy making and the implementation of maritime regulations. The correlation between the two phases facilitates assessment procedures and accelerates corrective actions when needed. On the other hand, it may involve the concentration of too much power in the hands of a Director and prevent him from implementing effective management rules. It appears that in the example of Canada and most of developed countries, a full independent policy-making body has been institutionalised.

In order to improve the level of efficiency of the Ivorian maritime administration, the author proposes a couple of measures that aim at strengthening the responsiveness of the two Directorates dealt with in Chapter 2, and at creating more dynamic interface in the relationship with the maritime industry.

5-8-1 Structural arrangements

The authority to determine functions that are devolved to each ministerial department originates from the President of the Republic who is bound by political considerations. Consequently, the basic structure of the maritime administration, and the missions assigned to it are out of the control of maritime administrators.

Nevertheless, the identification of impediments related to the structural cohesion needs to be brought to the attention of the political level in order to introduce suitable change to achieve this. The following measures are proposed:
- the appointment of a Director General to ensure effective co-ordination of the two Directorates at the highest level of the hierarchy; this measure would allow a
preliminary analysis of maritime matters before their transmission to the Ministerial Cabinet Council.
- the decentralisation of the maritime administration, by restoring the maritime district of San-Pedro in the south-west, and by creating maritime affairs sections along the coastline.

5-8-2 Staffing the organisation

The initiative taken in 1993 to create a department of maritime affairs within the Ecole Nationale d'Administration (ENA) led to a substantial increase in the number of senior officials working for the MARAD, and to increased recruitment at the intermediary and lowest levels. However, the organisation lacks qualified personnel with seafaring backgrounds. It is imperative that the personnel in charge of port state control in the context of the Western and Central African MOU be recruited from among Master mariners. Unfortunately, the level of remuneration that can be offered is not attractive enough compared with the wages paid in the shipping industry. Moreover, the conditions of recruitment set up in the Civil Service Code do not encourage potential applicants. In fact, the maritime administration should establish equivalence between certificates of competence of master mariners and the university degrees required to enter the ENA. This procedure is justified since the sea time needed to meet the requirement for the issuance of certificates of competence can be considered as equivalent to academic study time.

Following negotiations with unions, the Finish Maritime Administration has instituted the payment of a special allowance that is attached to positions for which master mariners are needed, in order to make them attractive. If the recipient abandons the position, he is no longer entitled to get it.
5-8-3 Updating the legal and regulatory framework

The basic legal instrument in use is the law adopted in November 9th 1961, instituting a Merchant Marine Code. The text is about forty years old and needs to be updated since there have been tremendous changes in the Ivorian shipping industry and the international environment. Furthermore, Côte d’Ivoire has ratified most of the IMO conventions listed in the Annex that need to be embodied in the law. Another important issue is to update subsidiary regulations and gather them in a unique document to be edited for the use of shipping operators.

5-8-4 Creating a dynamic relationship with users

The users of maritime public services are organised in different unions or associations for the defence of their professional interests.

There are four principal professional unions, namely
- the union of shipping companies and ship agents (SYNDINAVI)
- the union of forwarding agents (SYT)
- the union of towage and inland water transport companies
- the union of ship handlers of the port of Abidjan (SEMPA)

The four came together in 1958 and created the Maritime Federation (FEDERMAR). For their part, seafarers and fishermen have their respective unions (SYMICOM and SYMAPECI).

From the perspective of the maritime administration, the population target is clearly identified and organised, and are well positioned to become potential partners for administrative actions. The author proposes to institutionalise a forum of discussion, such as a maritime advisory council, in order to facilitate the collection of customers’ expectations and to obtain their commitment to the implementation of safety and environmental issues.
5-8-5 Pro-active behaviour of maritime senior officials

Maritime transport plays a key strategic role in the national economy, since 90% of the foreign trade is carried by sea and the shipping industry is the greatest provider of employment in the private sector. In this context, the ripple effects need to be channelled toward the development of the entire society. From this perspective, the author proposes that maritime administrators include the following actions in their action plans.

5-8-5-1 Employment of seafarers

The employment capacity of the national fleet has been quite limited since the dissolution of the national shipping company (SITRAM) in 1995. The privately owned shipping companies SIVOMAR and COMARCO, which had inherited the traffic rights of SITRAM before liberalisation of the sector, are engaged in chartering operations and cannot contribute to the re-absorption of unemployed seafarers nor assist those who had started their training. On the other hand, the Regional Academy of Marine Sciences needs to be maintained as an excellent training institution. Otherwise, the infrastructure and equipment afforded at very high costs would constitute a serious economic loss, and consequently the co-operation with donors would be affected.

The author proposes the adoption of measures in order to overcome the problems that currently exist in the international maritime employment market. Among others, the following steps should be taken:
- introducing an intensive english language program in the training to overcome the barrier of language;
- encouraging the creation of privately owned crew supplying agencies;
- including in the agenda of the Co-operation Committee at the IMO, the establishment of agreements with ship owners of developed countries for the accomplishment of sea time needed for certification and employment.
This strategy has been successful in Philippine where for the year 1999, the total number of seafarers sent abroad under the control of the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA) reached 200,000. This population generates yearly an inflow of about US$ 2 billion.

5-8-5-2 Development of projects

To encourage the development of private investment in the sector, the maritime administration must carry out studies, surveys and market analysis to identify potential activities that would be attractive to those investors seeking profitable businesses. In this context, the author proposes that the MARAD initiate a feasibility survey for an integrated water transport service through the lagoon connections between Abidjan and the neighbouring cities. The survey would involve evaluating the passenger and merchandise flows, analysing the customs and transport needs of local populations and setting up various cost comparative studies.

5-8-6 Implementation of international conventions

In its continuing battle for preventing loss of life and property at sea and pollution by oil, the IMO has generated a number of conventions. States parties to these conventions are required to give full implementation to the minimum standards regarding safety at sea and environmental protection. Côte d’Ivoire is highly concerned with these questions, recognising the importance of the traffic, the tonnage of cargo, and the flags of ships calling at the two national ports, all of which are available in the statistics edited by the relevant authorities.

To fulfil in a proper manner its obligations arising out of the international legal instruments, it is important that the MARAD consider the following points:
5-8-6-1 Hiring qualified Port State Control Officers (PSCOs)

It is stated in Chapter 4 of the Merchant Marine Code related to safety matters that any ship leaving a port of Côte d'Ivoire shall be subject to a departure inspection before proceeding to sea. The Chapter does not address port state control precisely and this gives rise to a serious problem of enactment since the inspection team has to refer to specific articles of the main IMO conventions and guidelines.

To comply with the qualifications of PSCOs stated in Annex 4 of the West and Central African Region Memorandum of Understanding (WCA MOU) which is attached to this work, the MARAD needs to hire Inspectors from among its master mariners, chief engineers and naval architects. The number of Inspectors should be sufficient to sustain a satisfactory rate of inspection with regard to the number of vessels calling annually at Ivorian ports.

5-8-6-2 Training of existing personnel

The *Ecole Nationale d'Administration* provides the basic knowledge to prospective maritime civil servants. However, even if the head of the Ship Inspectorate is a lecturer in this school, the author suggests that the MARAD takes all the necessary steps to send applicants expected to work for this structure, to the Word Maritime University to be duly trained for the purpose of implementing safety regulations. The MARAD may call for the IMO assistance, or engage direct consultations with the Registrar of the University.

In 1998, the number of ship calling at the port of Abidjan totalled 2,883. Among them 1,500 were flying flags of states known to practice open registry:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahamas</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St-Vincent and the Grenadines</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
During the same period, 523 ships called at the port of San-Pedro. 263 of them fell in the category described above:

- Bahamas 65
- Liberia 55
- Cyprus 54
- Panama 29
- St/Vincent and the Grenadines 28
- Honduras 4

The potential risks currently associated with open registries suggest that it is imperative for the MARAD to adopt strong training policies in order to achieve a satisfactory level of staffing of the Ship Inspectorate. Since the original institution of the WMU, only two civil servants of the MARAD of Côte d’Ivoire have been trained there, while for the year 2000, two other are going to be graduate in October.

In fact, there are many barriers to the development of this training that need to be broken down:
1/ the will at the top of the hierarchy where keeping a civil servant away from his position for 17 months is judged to be too long;
2/ the burden of travelling abroad to take an international english language test certificate;
3/ the availability of scholarships that lead applicants to wait one year or more before getting a feedback
4/ the graduation at WMU does not result in any change in the category and remuneration of the graduating civil servants
5/ the stringent procedures for departure: the time left between notification and the beginning of the program is short. During this period, the applicant has to take steps for the payment by the Treasury of the one-way journey air ticket to Malmö and get prepared to leave relatives for 17 months.
To overcome these problems, the MARAD needs to include the training of its senior officials at the WMU in its middle and long term action plans. Moreover, the Registrar of the University should put in balance the real needs of each country when allocating scholarships.

5-8-6-3 Appointment of a permanent representative at the IMO Headquarters

Côte d’Ivoire should have a permanent representative at the IMO who would be in charge of duties in connection with:

- evaluation and tracking of the co-operation needs of the MARAD;
- attending meetings on behalf of the MARAD;
- evaluation of initiatives aiming at updating international legal instruments;
- drawing lessons from the experience of other State members.

5-8-6-4 Certification of seafarers under the STCW Convention

In association with the staff of the maritime academy of Abidjan, the MARAD has launched an important program of re-structuring the seafarers' education system in order to comply with the relevant convention. However, a step needs to be taken in computerising the management of records of certificates issued to cadets. The objective of such an operation is to minimise the inherent risks of errors of manual treatment, to track the validity dates and to allow access to the database through a net system.

5-8-6-5 Prevention of pollution under the MARPOL Convention

Even if environmental matters are dealt with by the Ministry of Environment and Forestry, the MARAD needs to concern itself with oil tankers operating in national waters.
The port infrastructure comprises 3 sea loading berths, 2 of which are connected by submarine pipes to the national oil refinery. One berth, on an anchor buoy, can accommodate ships of 80,000 tons and the second one on single buoy can accommodate ships of 250,000 tons. Five other berths can receive smaller ships within the harbour. For the year 1998, about 6,636,000 tonnes of oil were loaded or unloaded through these installations by 49 ships. There is therefore a significant potential risk of oil pollution in the area related to ships operations.

The Ship Inspectorate should be sufficiently staffed and equipped to carry out controlling operations. This is not the case at present. The naval equipment at its disposal is limited to two small patrol crafts that can only go outside the harbour when the weather allows it.

Another problem that undermines the fight against oil pollution is the absence of reception facilities for oily wastes and garbage from ships. The MARAD also needs to extend controlling operations to the activities of drilling plate-forms within the EEZ.

Referring to the extent of the work to be done, it is strongly recommended that the Ship Inspectorate becomes an autonomous Safety Department instead of being ranked as an ordinary sub-division.

5-8-6-6 Casualty investigation under SOLAS/MARPOL/UNCLOS/ILO 147

In case of maritime casualty, an Investigation Commission is set up by ministerial order to carry out a preliminary investigation as stated in the Merchant Marine Code. The Commission, headed by the Director of the Maritime Affairs Department usually comprises members of the Ship Inspectorate and the Maritime Labour Inspectorate, a representative of the Class Society of the ship and a representative of the Port Authority.

From the above, it is clear that the Investigation Commission is not a permanent body since it is set up only when there is a specific need. This is inadequate since it reduces the responsiveness of the structure. Procedures for
signature of the ministerial order and the availability of members may lead to the loss of physical evidence related to a casualty.

Furthermore, the Casualty Investigation Commission should be empowered to carry out studies and surveys. The structure should extend over administrative duties and become a fundamental element of the maritime administration.

Canada has adopted a permanent and independent multi-modal investigation body called the Canadian Transportation Accident Investigation and Safety Board. Through this arrangement, authorities can carry out studies, surveys and risks assessment, which may help to prevent accidents or to understand quickly the reasons of accidents. It may happen that a casualty considered as an accident is in fact a criminal act in relation to insurance indemnities. Based on that, the structure should be available at any time.

5-8-6-7 Handling dangerous cargoes within the harbour under IMDG Code

Statistics show that the traffic of dangerous cargoes has been in constant progress. For the year 1998, about 185,000 tonnes of basic chemical products were handled in the port of Abidjan of which 75,702 tonnes were in transit for landlocked neighbouring states. In practice, the control exercised by the Ship Inspectorate is limited to checking the accurate labelling of containers. Afterward, the cargo is handled by ship-handlers whose agents have no knowledge about precautions to be taken. The author proposes that the MARAD organise regular seminars on the implementation of the IMDG Code for the benefit of ship-handlers.

5-8-6-8 Initiating an Incident Command System

The response system of the country to emergency situations consists of several organizations with dedicated equipment, resources, trained personnel and identified management staff. Each of these entities has a geographic sphere of authority and specific tasks to fulfil (natural disasters, fire, transport accident). Since planning for emergency situations involves management of national resources and seeking
efficiency, the maritime administration needs to work at the establishment of an Incident Command System. The objective would be to put all organizations providing public safety services under a unified command structure, guided by a consolidated action plan and a comprehensive resource management. Setting up a vertical organization dealing with safety and security matters, instead of several small entities, would involve a rational use of people and equipment and improve efficiency. Such a structure would be requested to practice as much as possible rescue operation simulations in order to get its components familiar with each other. The country had experienced the lack of co-ordination when an aircraft of Kenyan Airlines crashed into the sea on the 12th of January 2000, at 1.5 mile from the shore. The international media decried the presence of the navy, the fire brigade, the SAMU (Urgency Medical Care), the ASECNA (Air Navigation Safety Agency), the Abidjan Port Authority, a private towage company “Union des Remorqueurs d’Abidjan”, that were operating, each on its own, in a total disorder.

In the light of all the above, it appears that the MARAD is undermined by two major problems:
- the lack of duly qualified personnel for the implementation of maritime regulations
- the lack of initiative to enhance the responsiveness of the structures in charge of maritime matters.

The year 2000 is likely to be a year of fundamental change since the MOU enters into force. On the other hand, International Organisations, as the providers of development funds, are requiring the government to reduce its public administration and to increase its efficiency as a condition for initiating any further program support.

The challenge is manageable, provided that people in charge become more creative.
CHAPTER 6
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The development strategy based on state interventionism initiated by the
government to substitute for the low level of private investment contributed to the
creation of a huge public sector in Côte d’Ivoire. The economic crisis of the 1970’s
highlighted weaknesses in the system, mainly, structural incoherence, overstaffing,
immobility of personnel and lack of ethical values. It has therefore become
imperative for the country to join the global process of reforming public
administration in order to provide better service to citizens at the lowest costs.

In this perspective, the principles of the New Public management concept
initiated in some well-established democracies, offer an alternative for rendering
public administration more flexible and efficient. Basically, they consist of a set of
ideas and actions that include:
- the withdrawal of the government from the production process and reduction in
  the size of the public sector;
- the observance of effective management evolving out of market rules within the
  public administration;
- the focus of officials’ actions and decisions on client satisfaction.

The implementation of the NPM involves for the government, to launch a
formal and radical reform directed at increasing efficiency. Measures to be taken in
the context of this reform may include:
- strengthening procedures for collecting taxes
- clarifying public expenditures to eliminate unnecessary burden and to settle misuse of public funds;
- strengthening the privatisation process;
- implementing strong strategies of reduction of public staff;
- encouraging the diffusion among senior officials of effective management principles;
- initiating the rational use of technological equipment;

The most important challenge that the government has to face remains the development and dissemination of public service values among civil servants. It is a way to bring senior officials to develop more professionalism in running organisations for which they are given responsibility. Moreover, this strategy must be directed at strengthening personnel’s respect for public property and customers, and increasing their awareness of responsibility.

Another focal point of civil service value issues is the battle against corrupt practices. Alternatives for tackling the problem may include:
- the introduction of a code of conduct in the public administration.
- teaching civil servants at an early stage, values such as patriotism, honesty and fairness;
- giving full implementation to sanctions provided by the national legislation;
- licensing suppliers of goods and services that have to compete in public procurement and centralising the control over them;
- computerisation of the tracking of all public assets;
- assessing formally the real need of each organisation for the allocation of the budget.

The maritime administration that is part of the public sector, is concerned with this process. Maritime administrators need to extend beyond their routine administrative duties, and take initiatives aimed at the implementation of development policies.
There is also a need to strengthen the legal framework by incorporating in the basic law, the international conventions that have been ratified. Safety and environmental issues must be a major concern and maritime administrators have to take into account obligations evolving out of their ratification by the government and give them full implementation.


APPENDIX A
EXAMPLES OF MISSION STATEMENTS

The United States Department of Transportation

Serve the United States by ensuring a safe transportation system that furthers our vital national interests and enhances the quality of life of the American people.

The Canadian Department of Fisheries and Oceans

To manage Canada’s oceans and major waterways so that they are clean, safe, productive and accessible, to ensure sustainable use of fisheries resources and to facilitate marine trade and commerce.

The Canadian Coast Guard

To ensure the safe environmentally response use of Canada’s waterways, to support understanding and management of ocean resources, to facilitate the use of our waters for shipping, recreation and fishing, and to provide marine expertise in support of Canada’s domestic and international interests.

The Danish International Association for Safety and Survival Training

To facilitate the exchange of information on matters relating to safety in the maritime environment and to promote continuous improvement in safety and survival training internationally.

The South African Maritime Safety Authority (SAMSA)

To encourage and support the South African maritime transport industry in a manner which underpins the four fundamental objectives of the South African’s Shipping Administration and gives effect to the overall vision of transport.
APPENDIX B

Annex 4 of the West and Central African Region MOU

(QUALIFICATION CRITERIA FOR PORT STATE CONTROL OFFICERS)

1 In pursuance of the provisions of 3.5 of the Memorandum. The port State control Officers must be properly qualified and authorised by the Authority to carry out port State control inspections.

2 A properly qualified port State control Officer must have completed a minimum of one year’s service as a flag State surveyor dealing with surveys and certification in accordance with the relevant instruments and be in possession of:

.1 a certificate of competency as master, enabling that person to take command of a ship as specified in STCW, Regulation II/2, or
.2 a certificate of competency as chief engineer, enabling that person to take up that task on board a ship as specified in STCW, Regulation III/2, or
.3 has passed an examination as a naval architect, mechanical engineer or an engineer related to the maritime fields and worked in that capacity for at least 5 years, or
.4 has an equivalent qualification as determined by the Administration.

The port State control Officers mentioned under 1 and 2 above must have served for a period of not less than five years at sea as officer in the deck or engine department.

3 Alternatively, a port State control Officer is deemed to be properly qualified if that person:

.1 holds a relevant university degree or an equivalent training, and
.2 has been trained and qualified at a school for ship safety PSCOs, and
.3 has served at least 2 years as a flag State surveyor dealing with surveys and certification in accordance with the relevant instruments.

4 A properly qualified port State control Officer must be able to communicate orally and in writing with seafarers in the language most commonly spoken at sea.

5 A properly qualified port State control officer must have appropriate knowledge of the provisions of the relevant instruments and of the relevant procedures on port State control.

6 Port State control officers not fulfilling the above criteria are also accepted if they are employed for port State control by the Authorities, two (2) years before the date of the Memorandum was signed.
APPENDIX C

Articles 1, 8 and 12 of the OECD Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business Transactions

**Article 1 - The Offence of Bribery of Foreign Public Officials**

1. Each Party shall take such measures as may be necessary to establish that it is a criminal offence under its law for any person intentionally to offer, promise or give any undue pecuniary or other advantage, whether directly or through intermediaries, to a foreign public official, for that official or for a third party, in order that the official act or refrain from acting in relation to the performance of official duties, in order to obtain or retain business or other improper advantage in the conduct of international business.

2. Each Party shall take any measures necessary to establish that complicity in, including incitement, aiding and abetting, or authorisation of an act of bribery of a foreign public official shall be a criminal offence. Attempt and conspiracy to bribe a foreign public official shall be criminal offences to the same extent as attempt and conspiracy to bribe a public official of that Party.

3. The offences set out in paragraphs 1 and 2 above are hereinafter referred to as "bribery of a foreign public official".

4. For the purpose of this Convention:

   a. "foreign public official" means any person holding a legislative, administrative or judicial office of a foreign country, whether appointed or elected; any person exercising a public function for a foreign country, including for a public agency or public enterprise; and any official or agent of a public international organisation;

   b. "foreign country" includes all levels and subdivisions of government, from national to local;

   c. "act or refrain from acting in relation to the performance of official duties" includes any use of the public official's position, whether or not within the official's authorised competence.
Article 8 - Accounting

1. In order to combat bribery of foreign public officials effectively, each Party shall take such measures as may be necessary, within the framework of its laws and regulations regarding the maintenance of books and records, financial statement disclosures, and accounting and auditing standards, to prohibit the establishment of off-the-books accounts, the making of off-the-books or inadequately identified transactions, the recording of non-existent expenditures, the entry of liabilities with incorrect identification of their object, as well as the use of false documents, by companies subject to those laws and regulations, for the purpose of bribing foreign public officials or of hiding such bribery.

2. Each Party shall provide effective, proportionate and dissuasive civil, administrative or criminal penalties for such omissions and falsifications in respect of the books, records, accounts and financial statements of such companies.

Article 12 - Monitoring and Follow-up

The Parties shall co-operate in carrying out a programme of systematic follow-up to monitor and promote the full implementation of this Convention. Unless otherwise decided by consensus of the Parties, this shall be done in the framework of the OECD Working Group on Bribery in International Business Transactions and according to its terms of reference, or within the framework and terms of reference of any successor to its functions, and Parties shall bear the costs of the programme in accordance with the rules applicable to that body.
APPENDIX D

List of Companies to be privatised

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIELD OF ACTIVITY</th>
<th>COMPANY PROFILE</th>
<th>INFORMATION ON COMPANY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Air transport</td>
<td>National Airline (AIR IVOIRE) 100 %</td>
<td>Air transport of passengers and freight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public transport</td>
<td>Société des Transports Abidjanais (SOTRA) 60.1 %</td>
<td>Urban public transport in Abidjan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petrochemicals</td>
<td>Société Ivoirienne de Raffinage (SIR) 47.27 %</td>
<td>Crude oil refining and production of petrol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butane gas</td>
<td>Gaz de Côte d’Ivoire (GDCI) 60.7 %</td>
<td>Production and distribution of butane gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum Products</td>
<td>Gestion des Stocks Petroliers (GESTOCI) 12.5 %</td>
<td>Management of petroleum stocks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>Sté de construction et de gestion (SICOGI) 81 %</td>
<td>Construction of buildings for housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cattle rearing</td>
<td>Ranch de la Marahoué 100 %</td>
<td>Production of meat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial gas</td>
<td>Sté Ivoirienne Oxygène Acétylène (SIVOA) 21 %</td>
<td>Production and distribution of oxygen and acetylene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refrigeration</td>
<td>Sté d’Installation Frigorifique (SOCEF) 44.44 %</td>
<td>Construction of refrigeration equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cattle breeding</td>
<td>Station d’élévéage Panyan 100 %</td>
<td>Production of meat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>Complexe semencier de Sérébou 100 %</td>
<td>Production and distribution of seed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>Perimètre légumier de Marabadias 100 %</td>
<td>Production of vegetable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostelry</td>
<td>Hotel Président Yamoussoukro 96 %</td>
<td>5-star hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostelry</td>
<td>Hotels Ex-SIETHO 100 %</td>
<td>Hotel trade and tourism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Centre de Promotion de l'Investissement en Côte d'Ivoire, Abidjan
APPENDIX E

LIST OF IMO CONVENTIONS RATIFIED BY COTE D’IVOIRE

SOLAS CONVENTION 74
LOAD LINES CONVENTION 66
TONNAGE CONVENTION 69
COLREG CONVENTION 72
STCW CONVENTION 78
SAR CONVENTION 79
FACILITATION CONVENTION 65
MARPOL CONVENTION 73/78
LONDON CONVENTION 72
INTERVENTION CONVENTION 69
CLC CONVENTION 69
FUND CONVENTION 71
APPENDIX F

Confidential report of the State Inspectorate on corrupt practices through procurement, in relation with the EU financial aid

SOIT TRANSMIS

A L’ATTENTION DE
MONSIEUR LE MINISTRE
DE L’ÉCONOMIE ET DES FINANCES
ABIDJAN

Objet 4 EXEMPLAIRES DU RAPPORT DE L'AUDIT DES DEPENSES DU PROGRAMME D'APUI A L'AJUSTEMENT STRUCTUREL FINANCE PAR L'UNION EUROPÉENNE.

SECTEURS SANTE – DECENTRALISATION – ELECTIONS

RAPPORT PROVISOIRE SEPTEMBRE 1999

Inspecteur General

TANOH ABDONI
5.2.2. DETERMINATION DES RESPONSABILITÉS

L'on distinguera d'une part la responsabilité d'ordre administratif et d'autre part
la responsabilité d'ordre civil et pénale.

5.2.2.1 RESPONSABILITÉS D'ORDRE ADMINISTRATIF:

Elle concerne aussi bien les agents de l'Administration ivoirienne que ceux de la cellule du FED à Abidjan.

- En ce qui concerne l'Administration ivoirienne, elle a fait preuve de carence à divers niveaux d'intervention sur la chaîne des dépenses (contrôle, suivi des dossiers techniques, respect des procédures administratives, contrôle du service fait ...).
  - Absence de contrôle et de suivi des dossiers techniques
  - Non respect des procédures administratives
  - Insuffisance ou absence de contrôle du service fait.

Il convient d'insister plus particulièrement sur l'absence de contrôle de l'Inspection Générale de la Santé sur les services techniques du Ministère faute d'instructions ministérielles formelles dans ce sens. De même, la Direction des Equipements, du Matériel et de la Maintenance (DEMM) qui devait jouer le rôle d'une véritable cellule d'achat pour acquérir les matériels et équipements et réaliser les constructions et les réhabilitions à des prix raisonnables, s'est comportée comme une PME, cela au détriment des prix et de la qualité des prestations et des équipements. Cette attitude a favorisé les surfacturations, les faillimens de dépenses et l'exécution de travaux de mauvaise qualité.

- S'agissant du FED, signalons que les experts détachés auprès de l'Administration ivoirienne dans le cadre de ce financement n'ont pas exercé avec efficacité le contrôle des dossiers de règlement soumis à leur appréciation avant engagement et paiement.

En effet, conformément aux conventions et protocoles régissant les Programmes Généraux d'Importation (PGI), des experts du FED sont présents dans le circuit des dépenses. Leur mission consistait à vérifier la regularité des documents soumis à leur appréciation avant le décaissement des sommes engagées.

Or, il est apparu durant le fonctionnement de la procédure que ces experts n'ont pas joué pleinement leur rôle. Inutile de leur rappeler ici, pour éviter une répétition de leur position dans le cadre des dépenses appuyées par le FED.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DÉSIGNATION DU MATERIEL</th>
<th>PRIX MAXIMUM</th>
<th>PRIX MINIMUM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armoire bois 2 portes</td>
<td>136.000</td>
<td>93.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armoire vitrée à 1 baie</td>
<td>350.000</td>
<td>260.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armoire vestiaire</td>
<td>460.000</td>
<td>76.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armoire métallique 2 baies</td>
<td>544.000</td>
<td>324.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banc en bois 2 métiers</td>
<td>30.000</td>
<td>26.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banc pour visiteur</td>
<td>148.000</td>
<td>12.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table avec plateau en fer</td>
<td>94.400</td>
<td>60.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table avec allège</td>
<td>65.000</td>
<td>46.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bancard plus matelas</td>
<td>59.000</td>
<td>49.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bancard pliant toile cirée</td>
<td>390.000</td>
<td>78.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bancard toile kak fox</td>
<td>730.000</td>
<td>730.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bancard 1/4 vis en laque mousse</td>
<td>192.000</td>
<td>88.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bancard et porte bancard</td>
<td>294.500</td>
<td>294.500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureau simple 1 casier agent</td>
<td>82.400</td>
<td>58.800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureau simple 2 casiers Agent</td>
<td>236.300</td>
<td>275.400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureau Directeur</td>
<td>826.192</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureau secrétaire avol velours</td>
<td>318.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaîne visiteur</td>
<td>25.000</td>
<td>21.400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaîne en plastique</td>
<td>4.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaîne secrétaire</td>
<td>182.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porte 3 instrument</td>
<td>174.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porte porte bancard</td>
<td>750.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matériel d'acuité visuelle</td>
<td>Quantité</td>
<td>Unité</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miroir à eau</td>
<td>103 660</td>
<td>89.790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maroquinerie grand</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maroquinerie moyen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lampe d'examen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lot suède réuniformé</td>
<td>12 650</td>
<td>6 027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lot plateau inox</td>
<td>51 420</td>
<td>24 350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lot verre à pied</td>
<td>50 060</td>
<td>40 146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plateau inox</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assise plastique 125 ml</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assise plastique 250 ml</td>
<td>4 850</td>
<td>5 690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planeuse plastique 500 ml</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloison</td>
<td>1 500 000</td>
<td>733 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sac à déchets à couvercle et pédale</td>
<td>60 000</td>
<td>15 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Génière 2,5 cc, boîte de 120</td>
<td>9 268</td>
<td>9 268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secousse 10 cc, boîte de 80</td>
<td>7 826</td>
<td>7 826</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selles 5 cc, boîte de 100</td>
<td>7 020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stéthoscope Bucalinaire standard</td>
<td>355 000</td>
<td>135 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stéthoscope de Peraldi</td>
<td>4 560</td>
<td>3 159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stéthoscope du Japon simple-vido</td>
<td>12 000</td>
<td>12 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stéthoscope ostéopédiatrie</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stéthoscope</td>
<td>29 663</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: www.rfi.fr/Kiosque/Mfi/cotedivoire/100jours/docus.htm